

DRAFT

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA
HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD

Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, January 11, 2011

Large Conference Room, City Hall

3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way, Palm Springs, California 92262

BOARD MEMBERS:	Present This Meeting:	Present FY Year-to-Date:	FY: 2010/2011 Excused Absences:
John Gilmer, Chair	X		
Barbara Marshall, Vice Chair	X		
Thomas DeLeeuw	X		
Sheila Grattan	X		
Roxann Ploss	X		
Brian Strahl	X		
Leo Cohen	X		

Staff Representatives:

Craig A. Ewing, AICP,
Director of Planning Services
Staff Liaison

Glenn Mlaker, Assistant Planner

1. CALL TO ORDER: Chair Gilmer called the meeting to order at 8:15 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL: All members present.
3. POSTING OF AGENDA: The Agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber), City Clerk's office and Planning Services' counter on or before 4:00 p.m. on Thursday, January 6, 2011.
4. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None reported.
5. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: Minutes from the December 14, 2010 meeting.

Motion by DeLeeuw; second by Grattan; vote 7-0, to approve, minutes of December 14, 2010, as corrected.

6. PUBLIC HEARING:

- 6A. HPSB 77 – Frank Sinatra Residence - An application by Tom and Marianne O’Connell for the historic designation of 1145 Via Colusa, Zone R-1-C, Section 11. (CE)

Vice Chair Marshall recused herself from this item and left the room.

Director Ewing presented the staff report. The Board asked questions about:

- The elements of the property to be covered by the designation;
- The portions of the exhibits which are part of the application.

Chair Gilmer opened the hearing.

Ron Marshall, Palm Springs Preservation Foundation, described the Foundation’s sponsorship role in bringing the application to the Board, and summarized the findings of the application.

Patrick McGrew, applicant’s representative, noted that Frank Sinatra sold the house in 1953, not 1957, and indicated his support for the designation.

Questions by the Board included:

- Whether detailed floor plans exist
- Clarification on the building permits
- If additional information could be provided on Frank Sinatra’s involvement in the community
- Clarification that Frank Sinatra referred to the property as “Twin Palms”
- Changes made in the 1998 renovation.

Gil Benoit, 1170 Via Colusa, asked if the proposed designation would place any restrictions on adjacent properties identified in the notice map; Chair Gilmer noted that the designation has no regulatory effect on surrounding properties. Chair Gilmer closed the hearing.

Discussion by the Board included:

- Frank Sinatra’s significant involvement in the community after he moved from the subject property.
- The basis for making Finding 1 for the designation.
- The influence of this property on other celebrities building modern homes in the late 1940’s and 1950’s.
- Minor corrections to the resolution.

Motion by Ploss; second by DeLeeuw; vote 7-0, to continue the hearing, with direction to staff to revise the draft resolution recommending Class 1 designation, as follows:

- Include language in support of Finding 1 as E. Stewart Williams’ first

- commission, and its impact on other celebrities
- Add information regarding Frank Sinatra's involvement in the community for Finding 2.
- Board members are to forward additional support information to staff in advance of the next meeting.
- Amend to correct the dates of Frank Sinatra's ownership and occupancy of the property.

Vice Chair Marshall returned to the room.

7. CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL REQUEST(S):

- 7A. HSPB 12 – El Mirador Garage – Review of Certificate of Approval, granted January 2009 for exterior signs at Michael Lord Gallery on the El Mirador Garage building at 1090 North Palm Canyon Drive, Zone C-1, Section 10.

Director Ewing summarized the staff memo and the assertion by the tenant that no new lighting had been added.

Questions by the Board included:

- The number of fixtures on the property when the sign was approved (2009) versus the number on the property today.
- The availability of any historic photos of the property.

Charlie Mader, representing the property owner, noted his recent involvement with the property, and his interest in complying with the requirements of the City.

Discussion by the Board included:

- The availability of pictures during the opening of prior galleries.
- The difference between the sign submittal and the current condition.
- The City's process for permitting new exterior lighting.

The Board consensus was to direct staff to notify the property owner or tenant to submit an amendment request to the current sign approval regarding the exterior lighting.

- 7B. HD 1 – Las Palmas Historic District – Tara Lazar, owner of Pepper Tree Inn for the review of new door design and paint scheme for building wood elements at 645 N. Indian Canyon Drive, Zone R-3, Section 10.

Director Ewing summarized the staff memo, and noted that a landscape plan has not been submitted.

Questions from the Board included:

- The prior direction adopted by the Board and what has been presented by the applicant.

Carol Blum, applicant, noted that the Cheeky's brown color is darker than the proposed paint sample; a full graphics scheme is being prepared that will affect the door trim; and they wish to keep the doors white, but all other exposed wood to be brown; the name of the hotel will be "Alcazar". The Board confirmed:

- The proposed color (white) for the under side of the exterior ceiling and railing;
- The plan for building graphics and logo;
- The design and placement of the proposed door entry;
- The proposed tree species (Tipuana Tipus and Palo Verdes); and
- The landscape planters at the balcony rails.

Discussion of the Board included:

- The color of the exposed wood, doors, and railing;
- The brown color sample provided by the applicant; and
- The proposed entry.

Motion by Ploss to approve the proposed brown paint color for the underceiling, railings, lintels and door jambs, and the doors be left white. The motion died for lack of a second

Motion by DeLeeuw; second by Strahl; vote 7-0, to approve:

1. The proposed door entry;
2. The proposed brown paint color for the underside of the roof and the railings; and
3. The doors and door frames to remain white.

To continue:

4. The color of the lintels, to return as part of the sign / graphics program; and
5. The landscaping, to return with a landscape and irrigation plan.

- 7C. HSPB 53 – Coachella Valley Savings & Loan – Chase Bank for final review of hand and guard rails and landscaping at 499 South Palm Canyon Drive, Zone C-B-D, Section 15.

Associate Planner Newell summarized the staff memo.

Eric Peterson, of CDPC, representing the applicant, discussed the color for the railing, presented the ground cover samples, and discussed the landscape plan. Questions of the Board addressed:

- The use of the two types of ground cover within the landscape area;
- The color options for the railing;
- The design of the glass panels at the north and south ends of the front porch;

- The color and finish of the wall stand-offs;
- The use of floor mountings to support the glass panels to reduce the number of wall mounting points;
- The maintenance needs of the glass panels and adjacent surfaces;
- Confirmation that the glass panels will be clear, not tinted; and
- The type, color, number, size and placement of plant materials.

The Board discussed:

- The acceptability of the landscape plan;
- Uncertainty regarding the hand-rail color;
- Use of anodized, not painted, aluminum stand-offs;
- Use of floor mountings for the glass panels; and
- Placement of the historic marker on the monument sign base.

Motion by Grattan; second by Ploss; vote 7-0, to approve the project, as submitted, subject to:

1. Anodized stand-offs for the glass panel wall mountings
2. Floor supports for the glass panels; and
3. Color of railing to be "softer" (lighter) with final determination by staff, in consultation with the HSPB Chair.

8. OTHER BUSINESS:

- 8A. Case 3.0258 – Smoke Tree Ranch – Babson Residence – Demolition request of a 1,987 square foot house built in 1940, a Class 3 historic site, Zone R-1-A, Section 25.

Assistant Planner Mlaker summarized the staff report. Discussion by the Board addressed:

- Review of demolition and new construction by Smoke Tree Ranch;
- The size of the lot and the house;
- Establishing the house as a Class 2 historic site;
- Additional records associated with the dwelling (plans, photographs);
- Prior City and Smoke Tree Ranch approvals issued on this property;
- Relevance of dwelling to Smoke Tree Ranch and the community in the 1940's;
- The urgency regarding the request for demolition; and
- The need for a site visit and a photographic record prior to action on the demolition request or any redesignation.

Motion by DeLeeuw; second by Ploss; vote 7-0, to continue the item to the meeting of February 8, 2011, with direction to staff to:

1. Arrange a site visit;
2. Request the approval letter from Smoke Tree Ranch; and
3. Request a scaled floor plan of the current development.

Motion by DeLeeuw; second by Marshall; vote 3-4, to direct staff to initiate a Class 2 designation for this property. The motion failed.

- 8B. Las Palmas Business Historic District Committee – Board member DeLeeuw had no new information to report.
- 8C. Marker Text Sub-committee – Board member Grattan indicated that the ad-hoc Sub-committee met December 31, 2010 to review draft marker language, but further work remains prior to reporting to the full Board. A draft policy regarding preparation of marker language will also be presented to the Board. Chair Gilmer asked the sub-committee to consider a policy to require the property owner to purchase the marker, including investigating how other cities involve the property owner in marker costs.
- 8D. Public Outreach Sub-committee – Chair Gilmer reported that the sub-committee has not met since the last Board meeting, but wants to consider bringing forward to the Board the draft ordinance revisions.
- 8E. Preserve America Sign Sub-committee – Vice-chair Marshall reported that the sub-committee has not met since the last Board meeting, but wants to continue searching for an alternate location for the sign. She asked to take a look at the sign after the conclusion of the meeting.

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS AND SPECIAL PROJECTS:

None.

10. STAFF & OTHER REPORTS:

Director Ewing noted that the City Council will review the Cary Grant Estate application on January 19, 2011 and the DeBrabant House Mills Act contract on February 3, 2011. He also encouraged the Board to consider an outreach effort with Smoke Tree Ranch regarding historic status.

11. BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Board member Cohen noted the significance of the Smoke Tree Ranch Club House. He also commented about a recent article regarding historic preservation in Manhattan.

Board member Strahl asked staff to report on the El Paseo Building paint graphic facing Indian Canyon, and commented on the conditions adjacent to the Welwood Murray Memorial Library.

Vice Chair Marshall asked about the trash receptacles and grease trap adjacent to the Welwood Murray Memorial Library. She also asked about the latest Council direction regarding the library.

Board member Ploss commented on the conditions adjacent to the Welwood Murray Memorial Library.

Board member Grattan confirmed that staff will set up a site visit at the Babson House within Smoke Tree Ranch.

Chair Gilmer noted:

- The January 28, 2011 opening of the Don Wexler exhibition at the Palm Springs Art Museum, an excellent accompanying catalogue has been produced;
- Modernism Week runs from February 17 through 27, 2011.

12. ADJOURNMENT: Motion by DeLeeuw; second by Grattan; vote 7-0, to adjourn the Historic Site Preservation Board (at 11 a.m.) to its regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, February 8, 2011, at 8:15 a.m., in the Large Conference Room at City Hall.

Craig A. Ewing, AICP
Director of Planning Services