

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD

Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, June 14, 2011

Large Conference Room, City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way, Palm Springs, California 92262

BOARD MEMBERS:	Present This Meeting:	Present FY Year-to-Date:	FY: 2010/2011 Excused Absences:
John Gilmer, Chair	Χ	11	1
Barbara Marshall, Vice (Chair X	12	
Thomas DeLeeuw		11	1
Sheila Grattan	X	12	
Roxann Ploss	X	12	
Brian Strahl	X	12	
Leo Cohen	X	10	2
Staff Representatives:			

Staff Representatives:
Craig A. Ewing, AICP,
Director of Planning Services
Staff Liaison

Glenn Mlaker, Assistant Planner

- 1. CALL TO ORDER: Chair Gilmer called the meeting to order at 8:15 a.m.
- 2. ROLL CALL: Present: Cohen, Grattan, Ploss, Strahl, Vice-chair Marshall, Chair Gilmer Absent: DeLeeuw
- 3. POSTING OF AGENDA: The Agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber), City Clerk's office and Planning Services' counter on or before 4:00 p.m. on Wednesday, June 8, 2011.
- ELECTION OF OFFICERS Chair and Vice Chair
 Chair Gilmer noted that the Council re-appointed Mr. DeLeeuw and himself to the Board,
 and called for an election for Chair and Vice-Chair.

Director Ewing opened the nominations for Chair. Board member Ploss nominated Brian Strahl. Board member Grattan nominated John Gilmer. Vice-chair Marshall moved to close nominations and Board member Ploss seconded the motion. There were no objections and nominations were closed.



Vote for Chair:

Brian Strahl – Three Votes (Marshall, Ploss, Strahl) John Gilmer – Three Votes (Cohen, Gilmer, Grattan)

With a tie vote, the Board agreed to continue the item to the meeting of July and confirmed with Mr. Gilmer that he would continue to serve as Chair during this meeting.

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair Gilmer confirmed with the Board that the members of the public will be invited to comment on Certificates of Approval as part of the Board's review of such applications.

Patrick McGrew, asked the Board to review Certificates of Approval against the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Structures. He provided the Board with copies of the Secretary's Standards.

Eric Rosenow, Board Member, Palm Springs Preservation Foundation, spoke in opposition to the proposed remodel and expansion of the Welwood Murray Memorial Library (Case 5.1032 / HSPB #3).

- APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: Minutes from the May 10, 2011
 Motion by Ploss; second by Cohen; vote 4-0-2-1 (Gilmer, Cohen abstained; DeLeeuw absent), to approve the minutes of May 10, 2011, as submitted.
- 7. PUBLIC HEARINGS: None
- 8. CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL REQUEST(S):

Chair Gilmer indicated that the Board would be taking Item 8B out of order.

8B. Case 11-058 Sign / HD 3 – La Plaza: Bobby G's – An application by Best Signs representing the tenant for a Certificate of Approval for one sign located on the building facing La Plaza equaling fourteen (14) square feet, and one sign on the existing canopy overhang facing South Palm Canyon Drive equaling 5.35 square feet located at 160-C South Palm Canyon Drive (former Desmonds).

Assistant Planner Mlaker summarized the staff report. Director Ewing noted that a sign program for La Plaza will be a recommended condition on a separate application for some exterior changes to the property. The Board asked about:

- The size of the proposed tenant space,
- The location of additional signs for future, adjacent tenants,
- Conformity of the proposed signs with the Zoning Code limits



Jim Cross of Best Signs (applicant) described the signs, including placement, size, depth, materials, colors and lighting, as well as the issues surrounding the tenant's plans for current and future occupancy. The Board discussed the floor space to be occupied by the tenant, additional entries that may be required for future tenants and the color of the interior lighting of the proposed signs.

Motion by Grattan; second by Strahl; vote 4-2-0-1 (Ploss, Vice-chair Marshall, opposed; DeLeeuw absent), to approve the request, subject to use of warm white LED lighting within the signs.

8A. Case 5.1032 / HSPB # 3 (Welwood Murray Library) - An application by the City of Palm Springs to amend a Certificate of Approval for remodel and expansion of the existing public library building located at 100 South Palm Canyon Drive.

Director Ewing summarized the staff report, and noted that the applicant has provided additional drawings which were submitted following preparation of the staff report. The Board asked for information regarding:

-The AAC's request for additional information at its meeting of June 6, 2011.

Al Smoot, representing the City of Palm Springs as applicant, described the proposal, including:

- The City Council's directions regarding project;
- The proposed use of the building as a 21st century library branch;
- The design changes from prior submissions;
- Specific issues raised by the AAC, including the glass façade and the roofing system

Ana Escalante, project architect, presented the following information:

- Project avoids creating a replica of the historic structure;
- There is now a strong connection between the building interior and the patio;
- Access for the disabled was designed into the entire site;
- The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation have been satisfied;
- There is a history of additions and changes to the structure over the years;
- The evolution of the design as it followed a forensic investigation of the building;
- Overall direction regarding interior finishes and fixtures; details will be submitted for HSPB approval at a later date; and
- Various upgrades to environmental, mechanical and structural systems

The Board asked questions related to:

- Reconstruction of the ceiling in the main building;



- The new patio roof and its effect on the existing clerestory windows;
- The exterior treatment of the connection between the existing building and the new addition;
- The design details of the new roof and wall system; and
- The porch and patio enclosure as original and non-original features.

Public comments:

Patrick McGrew suggested that a restoration of the existing library, including the interior, porch and courtyard, be undertaken; he provided background information on the historic value and features of the building.

The Board discussed::

- The penetration of light into the building;
- The current height / space of the existing patio;
- Prior comments from the Board on this project;
- The juxtaposition of the proposed addition to the existing building;
- The possible restoration of the existing structure and fixtures;
- The existing ambient lighting in the building and the use of the clerestories and artificial lighting over the years;
- The location of the building within a collection of older buildings;
- The future programming of the building as a library;
- The experiences visitors would have in the space based on how the building is finished and programmed; and

Barbara Roberts, City Librarian, noted:

- The proposed program is for a public library, including a reference source for Palm Springs history, a visitor's center and a community meeting place.
- The current configuration does not serve well for library purposes; and
- The building had been modified several times over its life to accommodate new library needs.

The Board discussed:

- The need for additional research into the program for the building's use;
- The evolution of the patio's use, as both an open and enclosed space;

Motion by Vice-chair Marshall; second by Ploss; vote 2-4-0-1 (Cohen, Grattan, Strahl, Chair Gilmer opposed; DeLeeuw absent), to deny the request and direct the applicant to restore the existing patio, as open or enclosed. Motion failed.

Motion by Grattan; second by Strahl; vote 4-2-0-1 (Ploss, Vice-chair Marshall, opposed; DeLeeuw absent), to approve the request, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to issuance of building permits, the applicant shall submit for approval



by the HSPB the following plans:

- a. A complete exterior landscape plan, including plantings, irrigation, patio finishes, furnishings and access ramps,
- b. A complete interior plan, including finishes, fixtures and permanent furnishings;
- c. A security plan for the property; and
- d. A plan to protect the property and building from adjacent trash receptacles and waste storage.
- 2. Prior to issuance of building permits, the structural plans shall be revised to substitute round steel columns for the square tube columns proposed in the reconstructed enclosed patio.

9. COMMITTEE REPORTS AND SPECIAL PROJECTS:

- 9.A Las Palmas Business Historic District Committee No report.
- 9.B Racquet Club West Historic District Exploratory Committee Update

Board member Grattan reported that on May 14, 2011 she met with Margaret Gordinier, and then Ms Gordinier met the following week with her neighbors on the possibility of a creating a historic district. Ms. Gordinier reported back that there was opposition from some neighbors and that time will be needed over the next year to develop broader support.

10. STAFF & OTHER REPORTS:

Director Ewing noted that he has encouraged Ms Gordinier to take the long view about creating a historic district and to focus on education as a way to reduce uncertainties and fears among her neighbors.

10.A Summer meeting schedule

Director Ewing polled the Board about its summer schedule. The Board agreed to meet each month throughout the summer.

11. BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Board member Strahl asked about the El Paseo Building wall signage. Director Ewing stated that the sign has been repainted to conform to the prior approval. Mr. Strahl also noted that the Welwood Murray Memorial Library's landscape irrigation along Palm Canyon Drive is causing significant damage to the building's concrete wall. Director Ewing noted that he will forward this to the proper City staff.

Motion by Strahl; second by Cohen; vote 6-0-1 (DeLeeuw absent), to direct staff to



express to the City Council the Board's concern with the damage to the Welwood Murray Memorial Library building due to the landscape irrigation on the Palm Canyon Drive frontage.

Vice-chair Marshall voiced her disappointment that the Board must resort to such a motion to spur City action on protecting the library building.

Board member Ploss expressed her disappointment with the Board's action on the Welwood Murray Memorial Library

12. ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Grattan; second by Marshall; vote 6-0-1 (DeLeeuw absent), to adjourn. The HSPB adjourned to its regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, July 12, 2011, at 8:15 a.m., in the Large Conference Room at City Hall.

Craig A. Ewing, AICP
Director of Planning Services