

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS  
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES  
May 09, 2012  
Council Chamber, City Hall  
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way  
Palm Springs, CA 92262

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Chair Donenfeld called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m.

<b>ROLL CALL:</b>	<b>Present This Meeting:</b>	<b>Present to Date:</b>	<b>FY: 2011/2012 Absences:</b>
Lyn Calerdine	X	4	0
Tracy Conrad	X	17	2
Philip Klatchko	X	15	4
Leslie Munger	X	17	2
J.R. Roberts	X	19	0
Doug Hudson, Vice Chair	X	16	3
Doug Donenfeld, Chair	X	18	1

**REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA:**

The agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Services counter by 4:00 p.m. on Thursday, May 3, 2012.

**ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:**

Commissioner Munger noted her abstention on Item 3A.

The Commission unanimously accepted the agenda; noting Commissioner Munger's abstention.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

Chair Donenfeld opened public comments:

-Jesse Cross, representing Best Signs, spoke in reference to Item 2A (Ralph's/CVS

Pharmacy shopping center), commented that the City Council approved a larger height for the monument signs and the AAC's recommendation to reduce the sign by twenty percent will not work.

-Greg Bever, Lundin Development, spoke in reference to Item 2A, stated that the redesign reflects the direction given by the City Council; and is in agreement with the AAC's recommendation with the exception of item #1 and #7.

There being no further comments public comments was closed.

## **1. CONSENT CALENDAR:**

**ACTION:** To approve Items 1A and 1B, as part of the Consent Calendar.

**Motion Lyn Calerdine, seconded by Leslie Munger and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.**

**AYES:** Leslie Munger, Tracy Conrad, Philip Klatchko, J.R. Roberts, Chair Donenfeld, Vice Chair Hudson, Lyn Calerdine

**1A. Case 3.1067 MAA - A request by Natalino Filippini, owner, to construct a 590-square foot two-car garage on a hillside lot located at 2390 Araby Drive, Zone R-1-B, Section 25. (Project Planner: Glenn Mlaker, AICP, Assistant Planner)**

Approved, as part of the Consent Calendar.

**1B. Case 3.3467 MAJ - A request by Towne Construction to build a 2,9971-square foot block warehouse building and associated off-street parking located at 253 Oasis Road, Zone M-1, Section 34. (Project Planner: Glenn Mlaker, AICP, Assistant Planner)**

Approved, as part of the Consent Calendar.

## **2. OTHER BUSINESS:**

**2A. Case SP 06-084 AMEND - A request by Best Signs, Inc. for a revised design of the previously approved sign program amendment to allow larger monument signs at the Ralph's / CVS Pharmacy shopping center located at 425 South Sunrise Way, Zone RA (Section 14 Specific Plan), Section 14. (Project Planner: David A. Newell, Associate Planner)**

David A. Newell, Associate Planner, provided an overview of the proposed project as presented in the staff report dated May 9, 2012.

Commissioner Conrad requested clarification from staff on the City Council's decision to overturn the Commission's denial. Principal Planner Robertson responded that the City Council's main concern was for the businesses without street frontage. He explained that the City Council approved two larger monument signs to allow for better quality design.

Commissioner Conrad commented that the sign program for this shopping center is more restrictive than similar ones because of the less total acreage on this site.

Commissioner Roberts expressed a preference for the original proposed signage; noting a concern with the large size and loud colors of the modified design.

Commissioner Munger commented that the modified signage is inappropriate for the complex and expressed a preference for the originally proposed signs.

Commissioner Calerdine commented that he was not on the Commission when this project was originally presented; however, he is in favor of the Architectural Advisory Committee's recommendations with the exception of #1 and #7.

Vice-Chair Hudson spoke in favor of the original proposed signage; noting that the font size on the modified signs is larger.

Commissioner Conrad spoke in opposition of allowing the corporate logo's on the monument signs.

Chair Donenfeld requested staff seek legal clarification from the City Attorney on free speech rights for corporate logos.

**ACTION:** To approve, subject to the Architectural Advisory Committee's recommendations with the exclusion of item #1 and #7, as amended:

1. ~~Sign to be scaled down twenty percent in size;~~
2. Tenant signs to match on both sides of the monument sign;
3. Any non-street fronting tenant to remove signs on street front buildings if identified on either monument sign (this was based on a reference to the frozen yogurt tenant on the north side of the center which has signage on the building facing the street at the southeast corner of the center);
4. Change slate tile material to a tan stucco that matches existing buildings in center;
5. Terminate vertical supports of tenant signage at top of placard sign;
6. Blank tenant space signs shall be placed at bottom slots;

7. Individual tenant placard signs shall not include a logo;
8. Grasses adjacent to monument signs to be removed and replaced with Carissa species.

**Motion Lyn Calerdine, seconded by Chair Donenfeld. MOTION FAILED.**

**AYES:** Chair Donenfeld, Lyn Calerdine  
**NOES:** Leslie Munger, Tracy Conrad, Philip Klatchko, J.R. Roberts, Vice Chair Hudson

**ACTION:** To approve, subject to the recommendations by the Architectural Advisory Committee, as amended:

1. Sign to be scaled down twenty percent in size;
2. Tenant signs to match on both sides of the monument sign;
3. Any non-street fronting tenant to remove signs on street front buildings if identified on either monument sign (this was based on a reference to the frozen yogurt tenant on the north side of the center which has signage on the building facing the street at the southeast corner of the center);
4. Change slate tile material to a tan stucco that matches existing buildings in center;
5. Terminate vertical supports of tenant signage at top of placard sign;
6. Blank tenant space signs shall be placed at bottom slots;
7. Individual tenant placard signs shall not include a logo;
8. Grasses adjacent to monument signs to be removed and replaced with Carissa species;
9. Each tenant placard-sign shall not be larger than the CVS Pharmacy sign;

**Motion Tracy Conrad, seconded by Leslie Munger and carried 6-1 on a roll call vote.**

**AYES:** Leslie Munger, Tracy Conrad, Philip Klatchko, J.R. Roberts, Vice Chair Hudson, Lyn Calerdine  
**NOES:** Chair Donenfeld

**3. PUBLIC HEARING:**

**3A. Case Pre-App 12-001 - A Pre-Application by Pacifica Colony Palms, LLC, for a proposed five story hotel with restaurant and retail uses, off street parking and landscaping on a roughly 1.13-acre parcel located at 750 North Palm Canyon Drive; Zone C-1/R-3 PD 104, Section 10. ( Project Planner: Ken Lyon, Associate Planner)**

Commissioner Munger would not be participating in the discussion and vote and left the Council Chamber at 2:07 p.m.

Ken Lyon, Associate Planner, provided background as presented in the staff report dated May 9, 2012.

Chair Donenfeld opened the public hearing:

-Hugh Gaspar, project architect and designer, described the project consisting of a 4-story building with a small portion on the roof as a restaurant. Mr. Gaspar further outlined the PD application and their necessity to seek approval from deviations of the underlying development standards. He requested direction from the Commission to further improve the project.

-Nicki McLaughin, representing the Palm Springs Modern Committee, spoke in opposition of the proposed project due to the height and massing and the project's lack of compliance with the historic district design guidelines.

-Felipe Castaneda, hotel and restaurant owner, expressed concern with the density and height of the proposed hotel.

- Frank Tysen, commented that the pre-application process is a waste of time and the proposed project's lack of conformance to the zoning standards.

-Jeff Brown, noted appreciation for the synergy of the project but voiced concern with the size and lack of historic elements to the building.

-Clifford Lloyd, neighbor and part of the development team, expressed appreciation for Commissions review of the proposed project.

-Hugh Gaspar, applicant rebuttal, noted the existing building's tall height and large trees; he clarified that it is their goal to fit into the existing neighborhood.

There being no further comments the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Calerdine said he would like to see a detailed analysis of how the proposed project it fits into the neighborhood, what the public benefit is and public comments from the surrounding neighborhood organizations.

Vice-Chair Hudson made the following comments:

-To include more details connecting the project to the neighborhood;

-A complete analysis of the distance of the rooms and balconies to the property lines

-Include more articulation and massing at the upper levels;

-If a rooftop restaurant or swimming pool is proposed, prepare an analysis to address mitigation of noise;

-Further analysis of the driveway location along Indian Canyon Drive and Via Altamira to align both and minimize potential traffic issues;

-Public benefit for the project;

-The architecture design to reflect the style of the neighboring buildings;

-Address vehicular circulation and parking;

Commissioner Roberts commented that this project is not so much about historical replication but rather coming up with a design that fits well into the neighborhood, scale is out of proportion and parking is an issue.

Commissioner Conrad noted appreciation for the pre-application process finding it helpful to the applicant and community. She commented that the idea of the historic district is not intended to dictate style or replicate but rather to consider the fabric of the neighborhood. She explained that the PDD is not intended to completely abandon the zoning regulations but to give some flexibility and derive the highest and best use of a property. The proposed project has commendable features. The architectural elements are very large, concerned with the street level parking, orientation of the building, intense density of the project.

Commissioner Klatchko spoke in favor of the pre-application process in a public hearing forum and agreed with the comments made by his fellow Commissioners and the Architectural Advisory Committee.

Chair Donenfeld recapped the comments made by the Commission. He pointed-out the massive look of the architecture and suggested more creative ways be implemented to provide more detail to the building.

Principal Planner Robertson reported that the comments from the HSPB, AAC and Planning Commission will be forwarded to the applicant so that they may incorporate them into the final design, if so desired, or the applicant may decide to present an entirely different pre application.

Commissioner Munger re-entered the council chamber at 2:56 p.m.

#### **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENTS:**

Chair Donenfeld spoke on behalf of the Commission expressing great appreciation for the many years of service Dianne Marantz provided to the City of Planning Springs as Chair and a Member of the Planning Commission. He expressed heartfelt condolences to her family.

Commissioner Roberts requested code enforcement follow-up on the extremely large "for lease" sign at the Albertsons shopping center on Vista Chino and Sunrise Way. He also requested follow-up on the red over-spray paint on the palm trees at the 7-Eleven store on Vista Chino Way.

#### **PLANNING DIRECTOR'S REPORT:**

Principal Planner Robertson thanked the Commission for their comments to the applicant on the pre-application.

Mr. Robertson informed the Commission about the two expired terms on the Architectural Advisory Committee and would follow-up on the next step.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

There being no further comments the Planning Commission adjourned at 3:12 p.m. to Wednesday, May 23, 2012, at 1:30 p.m., at City Hall, Council Chamber, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

---

Craig A. Ewing, AICP  
Director of Planning Services

DRAFT