

HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

Large Conference Room, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way, Palm Springs, California 92262
www.palmspringsca.gov

MINUTES

JUNE 9, 2015



9:00AM
REGULAR MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL: Chair Gary Johns, Vice-Chair Roxann Ploss, Members Dick Burkett, Todd Hays, Bill La Voie, Linda Dixon, James Williamson

ABSENT: (none).

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA: M/S/C (Dixon / Hays) 7-0 to approve.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

COREY ALDER, President of Nexus Companies / O & M LLC, spoke in opposition of the proposed application for consideration of Class 1 designation and the proposed stay of demolition of the Tahquitz Plaza at 600, 650, 700 and 750 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

ROBERT IMBER, of Palm Springs Modern Tours, spoke in opposition of Case 5.0712; the proposed changes at the William Cody-designed Shell gas station on North Palm Canyon Drive.

HUGH KAPTUR, Architect and developer of Tahquitz Plaza I and II, spoke in support of the proposed designation of the Tahquitz Plaza Buildings and in opposition of the proposed "Aberdeen" development proposed for that site.

RENEE BROWN, of the Palm Springs Historic Society (PSHS) spoke about the continued deterioration of the City-owned Cornelia White House and asked the HSPB to intervene on the PSHS' behalf to demand the City act swiftly to stabilize and preserve the structure; the second oldest existing in Palm Springs.

PETER MORUZZI, founder of the PS Modern Committee, spoke in support of the Tahquitz Plaza Class 1 historic designation and urged the HSPB to place a stay of demolition on the structures. He noted the PS Modern Committee has submitted an appeal to the City of the owner's recent application to demolish the structures.

SOBHY YOUSEF, owner of the William Cody-designed Shell Gas station, spoke in support of the Certificate of Approval request for modification to the gas station.

STAN POLLAKUSKI, designer for the modifications to the Shell station spoke in support of the certificate of approval request and further explained the proposed modifications.

CHRIS MENRAD, resident, spoke in support of the Tahquitz Plaza Class 1 historic designation application, and expressed concern about safety and security of the buildings and reminded the City about the vacant building ordinance and his concern that the owner was not maintaining the security of the now vacant buildings.

JADE THOMAS NELSON, resident, expressed his support of the Boards' ongoing efforts and concerns about pressures of development on historic structures and the loss of historic sites. He expressed his support for the Tahquitz Plaza class 1 nomination, the Orbit In Class 1 designation, the Morse Residence Class 1 nomination, and concern about the adverse impact of the proposed modifications to the Cody-designed Shell gas station.

The Chair closed public comment.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

1.A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:, MAY 12,2015 MEETING.

Board member Ploss, item 4B, requested her comment that owner neglect should not be used as a reason for demolition be included. Also that the minutes recognize the passing of former Board member Sheila Grattan and her contribution to the efforts of the HSPB during her tenure on the board.

Board member La Voie noted on page 3 under "skylights" insert comma, and insert "..and the poolside cabanas."

M/S/C (Hays/Dixon) 6-0-1 (Hays abstained) to approve as corrected.

2. UNFINISHED BUSINESS: (none)

3. NEW BUSINESS:

3.A. PALM SPRINGS PLANNING COMMISSION REFERRAL OF A REQUEST BY GERGIS YOUSEF FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT AMENDMENT TO EXPAND THE EXISTING RETAIL SPACE FOR A WILLIAM F. CODY DESIGNED GAS STATION LOCATED AT 2796 NORTH PALM CANYON DRIVE, ZONE C-1 (CASE 5.0712 CUP).

Planning Director FAGG explained the Planning Commission's action to refer this item to HSPB for its review, comments, and recommendations to the Commission before the Commission considers action on the application.

Staff Planner NEWELL summarized the project and the staff report.

Member LA VOIE opined that the proposed material (metal panel) and finish is inappropriate as is the relationship of the proposed (and previous) addition to the original building.

Member WILLIAMSON felt much of the historic integrity of the original building has been lost and shouldn't be further compromised.

Member BURKETT noted the proposed project would further compromise the historic integrity of the original building.

Chair JOHNS discussed the significance of the building, its architect, and the context in which it was developed in the 60's. He noted opportunities and options that the owner could consider to expand the business model at the site while not further compromising the building's architecture. He recommended staff set up HSPB site visits and AAC site visits to better understand the site and explore whether there are City grants that may assist the applicant in business growth (including architectural tours) and building restoration.

Member DIXON does not recommend further modifications to the exterior appearance of the building.

Recommendations to the Planning Commission:

1. Recommend the building for Class 1 designation.
2. Retain the garage doors at the service bays and construct any proposed new wall behind it so as not to alter the exterior appearance of the original building.
3. Accommodate the proposed use within the (currently) existing building footprint without further additions.
4. Make no changes to the exterior of the original bldg.
5. Consider repainting the building in its original colors and consider using different paint colors to differentiate the addition from the original building.
6. Any changes should be done in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Structures.
7. If an addition is proposed, break the wall plane to distinguish original from new.
8. If an addition is proposed, new walls should be no closer than 2 feet from the existing structural column and should not enclose it with the proposed new building.
9. Clerestory windows should be preserved.
10. Canopy structure should be restored, removing surface mounted conduit, damage, etc.
11. Staff should set up site visits for HSPB and AAC members to allow them to complete their recommendations to PC.

12. The Board recommended that the Owner consider wider marketing approach to the overall property, possibly adding a tourist related component (tours, etc.) to increase the economic viability of the site.
13. Board recommended against the project itself, stating that it further compromises integrity of the original bldg.
14. Open dialogue with applicant and City staff in seeking city funds to collaborate and contribute to restoration / revitalization / expanded use of the site.

3.B. AN APPLICATION BY CHRIS & MERAH BOND FOR CLASS 1 HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1932 SOUTH NAVAJO DRIVE, ZONE R 1 C (CASE HSPB #96).

MISIC (Ploss / La Voie) 7-0 to receive the application and historic resources report initiate study and investigation pursuant to PSMC 8.05.135 and direct staff to arrange site inspections for HSPB members to review the site and to prepare a noticed public hearing at the HSPB meeting of July 14, 2015 to consider the application.

3.C. INITIATE STUDY PURSUANT TO PSMC 8.05.135 FOR POSSIBLE CLASS 1 HISTORIC SITE DESIGNATION OF 600 – 750 EAST TAHQUITZ CANYON WAY, "THE TAHQUITZ PLAZA", ZONE REO (CASE HSPB #97).

Director FAGG clarified the process initiated herein for the applicant (who expressed concern that he received noticed of this agenda item the day before). The HSPB may not take any formal action recommending designation to the City Council prior to the public hearing but may initiate study without public hearing.

MISIC (Ploss / Dixon) 7-0 to receive the historic resources report and initiate study and investigation pursuant to PSMC 8.05.135 on the subject site in consideration of the submitted Class 1 historic resources report and continue the matter to a noticed public hearing of July 14, 2015 and direct staff to arrange site visits for board members to familiarize themselves with the content of the report and the conditions at the site.

3.D. INITIATE A STAY OF DEMOLITION PURSUANT TO PSMC 8.05.170 FOR 600 TO 750 EAST TAHQUITZ CANYON WAY "THE TAHQUITZ PLAZA", ZONE REO (CASE HSPB #97).

Member WILLIAMSON asked questions regarding the process of stay and who can remove it.

Director FAGG clarified that the stay is typically lifted after the action to consider designation is complete by the City Council, or if no recommendation is made by the HSPB, the stay can be terminated at that time. He will review with the City Attorney whether a stay can be lifted under other circumstances.

M/S/C (LaVoie / Dixon) 7-0 to Initiate a 120-day stay of demolition pursuant to PSMC 8.05.170, to allow the board time for necessary studies, hearings and determination whether such site should be designated as an historic site.

- 3.E. AN APPLICATION BY NEAL WILSON, OWNER TO DEMOLISH ALL STRUCTURES ON A CLASS 3 HISTORIC SITE LOCATED AT 2715 ANZA TRAIL, ZONE R-1-B (CASE 3.3879).

Staff planner Lyon summarized the staff report.

LINDA REES, project manager for the owner, noted the structure is very deteriorated and the owner seeks its demolition.

Member Hays argued about incremental change over time of loss of individual building to demolition. He noted that the subject building reflects a certain modest type of vernacular building from a certain period and should be given serious consideration to not demolish.

M/S/C (Hays / Ploss) to place a stay of demolition to allow time to study the merits of the structure for possible historic designation. (2-5) (La Voie, Williamson, Dixon, Burkett, and Johns opposed) motion failed.

Member La Voie noted original structure is sufficiently compromised so as not to be able to convey historic significance. The board took no further action and thus staff will process an approval of the demolition request.

4. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

- 4.A. AN APPLICATION BY GARY & JOAN GAND FOR CLASS 1 HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1197 ABRIGO ROAD "THE THEODORE & CLAIRE MORSE RESIDENCE", ZONE R-1-C (CASE HSPB #94).

Staff Planner LYON summarized the staff report.

Chair JOHNS opened the public hearing.

JIM HARLAN, representing the owner summarized the application.

Member PLOSS asked if the natural rock front wall was always painted white. (Mr. Harlan noted early photos did show the wall painted white).

ROBERT MOON, neighbor to the subject site spoke in favor of the proposed designation.

Chair JOHNS closed the public hearing.

Member LA VOIE noted doors are fully pocketed, stone walls full height, no dropped header are all factors that argue that the construction typology is unique.

MISIC (Ploss / La Voie) (7-0) to adopt Resolution No. HSPB 94, "A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD OF THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL DESIGNATE 1197 ABRIGO ROAD, "THE THEODORE & CLAIRE MORSE RESIDENCE", CLASS 1 HISTORIC SITE #94, SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS."

- 4.8. HSPB 95: AN APPLICATION BY KEVIN MILLER AND JIN SUK PARK REQUESTING CLASS 1 HISTORIC DESIGNATION FOR "THE VILLAGE MANOR" (A.K.A. "ORBIT IN") LOCATED AT 562 WEST ARENAS ROAD, ZONE R-2 (CASE HSPB #95) (KL)

Staff member LYON summarized the staff report.

Chair JOHNS opened the public hearing.

JADE THOMAS NELSON, representing the owner spoke in support of the nomination.

Member PLOSS spoke in support of the nomination but objected to the integration of the recently added security gate. (Mr. NELSON explained the security requirement that necessitated the addition of the gate.)

Member LA VOIE notes the reference to Mr. Burns as "architectural designer" in the applicant's historic resources report may not be appropriate given that Mr. Burns was not a licensed architect.

(MISIC) (La Voie / Ploss) (7-0) to adopt Resolution No. HSPB 95, "A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD OF THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL DESIGNATE 562 WEST ARENAS ROAD, "THE VILLAGE MANOR" CLASS 1 HISTORIC SITE #95, SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS."

5. DISCUSSIONS:

5.A. 2015/16 ANNUAL WORK PLAN

Staff Planner LYON summarized the purpose and outline for the FY15116 Work Plan.

Member PLOSS suggested a subcommittee to consider work plan.

Member DIXON offered the following suggestions for items to include in the work plan: (1) Increase fines for work without HSPB approval, etc. (2) Building permits visible from street (3) conclude work on LPBHD, (4) demo permits should state HSPB review requirement on class 3 buildings, (5) classes / study sessions to help board members learn processes.

Chair JOHNS noted (1) the board should be more proactive in bringing Class 1 nominations forward for consideration, (2) conclude work on LPBHD.

Member BURKETI offered suggestion of (1) moving forward the Class 3 designation up more recently than 1969 (i.e. 45 years instead of a set year. (2) discuss approving demolition requests without plans for a replacement structure or new site use clearly defined first, (3) Cornelia White House stabilization & restoration, (4) consider interiors on recommendations for privately owned structures for Class 1 designation to City Council, (5) awards for outstanding preservation initiatives, (6) Complete HRG (Citywide Historic Resource Inventory) effort.

Subcommittee PLOSS, LA VOIE, DIXON to review suggestions on work plan and prioritize and make recommendations back to the Board at the July meeting.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Chair JOHNS asked for an update on Corneila White House progress, status of Tram Way visitor center proposed landscape, Measure J funds.

Member PLOSS asked for update on Cornelia White and deterioration at the Cork n Bottle.

Member BURKETI raised safety issues and an update on unapproved work on the Wexler Steel House.

Member PLOSS asked how the board might expedite processing of enforcement actions.

STAFF COMMENTS: (None)

M/S/C (Hays / Ploss) to adjourn.

ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Site Preservation Board adjourned to its regularly scheduled meeting of Tuesday, August 11, 2015, at 9:00 A.M, in the Large Conference Room at City Hall.