

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES
November 12, 2015
Council Chamber, City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way
Palm Springs, CA 92262

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Klatchko called the meeting to order at 1:41 pm.

ROLL CALL:

Present This Meeting: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld,
Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton,
Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts and Chair
Klatchko

Absent This Meeting: None

Staff Present: Flinn Fagg, Michael Daudt, Marcus Fuller, Terri Hintz, David
Newell and Edward Robertson

REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA:

The agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Services counter by 6:00 pm on Thursday, November 5, 2015.

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

Chair Klatchko announced that due to the length of the agenda Items 2C, 4A and 5A have been proposed to be continued.

ACTION: Continue Items 2C (Case 5.1327 PD 366), 4A (Case 3.0678 MAJ) and 5A (5.1378 PD 379, ZC 3.3876 MAJ and TTM 36914) to a date certain of November 18, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Vice-Chair Roberts and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair Klatchko opened public comments:

JOHN ALITA, property owner, Palm Springs Country Club, (in reference to Item 2C) spoke in support of the project; however, expressed concern with a proposed road in front of his house and lack of swimming pools and community center.

GREG ALVES, property owner, Palm Springs Country Club, (in reference to Item 2C) expressed concern with the loss of views, lack of community center and height of homes.

CURT WATTS, property owner, Sunrise Park, spoke in reference to a landscape screening condition imposed by the Commission for the carports at Sage and Mojave Blue Apartments.

JUDY DEERTRACK, (in reference to Item 2A) expressed concern with the profound changes to the Museum Market Plaza Specific.

CHUCK STEINMAN, (in reference to Item 2A) said the Specific Plan is not clear about the width or design of the Andreas extension and requested residential elements be added to the new hotels.

MIKE GUERRA, (in reference to Item 2B) expressed concern that documents were not attached on the website and requested a continuance; opposes another 6-story hotel.

FRANK TYSEN, (in reference to Items 2A and 2B) expressed concern with the height of the buildings, narrowing of Palm Canyon, too dense, lack of vacancy, economic and parking studies. He urged the Commission to wait until the new Council is seated.

NICKI MCLAUGHLIN, representing the Palm Springs Modern Committee, (in reference to Item 2A) spoke in oppositions to revisions being made to the Specific Plan.

EMILY HEMPHILL, legal consul for Wessman Development, addressed public testimony given regarding to the Downtown project (Items 2A and 2B).

DAVID ZIPPEL, said he does not recall the Planning Commission approving a 3rd story for Block A of the downtown project.

MICHAEL JOHNSTON, (in reference to Item 2A) commented about the reduction of 30 feet on Museum Way.

JOY BROWN-MEREDITH, (in reference to Item 2A) expressed concern with removal of step backs and parking requirements, reduction of sidewalk width; a requested a flag be placed to see the height of the Kimpton hotel.

TIM ERKIN, (in reference to Item 2A) encouraged slowing down and suggested spreading out the development and noted that more bike lanes are needed to bring in tourism.

CHRIS PARDO, project designer, Downtown Project, provided the dimensions on setbacks, street and sidewalks widths.

TIM O'KEEF, (in reference to Serena Park) said that traffic issues are not addressed and requested the Specific Plan be re-opened for further review.

-DAVID BRUGEMAN, (in reference to Item 2A) said he was surprised to read about the height that is allowed in the Specific Plan and commented that the hotels fit within these requirements and the city needs to appeal to a new market.

There being no further appearances the Public Comment was closed.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

ACTION: Approve, Items 1A, 1B (with changes) and 1C, as part of the Consent Calendar.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Vice-Chair Roberts and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

1A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: OCTOBER 14, 2015 AND OCTOBER 28, 2015 STUDY SESSION MINUTES

Approve, as submitted.

1B. MEREDITH R. HYATT & RAUL O. ESCAMILLA'S REQUEST FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION APPROVAL FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A ONE-STORY DUPLEX AT 753 EAST COTTONWOOD ROAD, ZONE R-2 (3.2855-MAJ). (ER)

Approve, with changes.

1C. WILLIAM BOLLBACH AND MICHAEL CURCIO FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO CONSTRUCT A 4,756-SQUARE FOOT RESIDENCE ON A VACANT HILLSIDE LOT LOCATED AT 818 WEST STEVENS ROAD, ZONE R-1-A (CASE 3.3798 MAJ AND 7.1481 AMM). (DN)

Continue to a date certain of December 9, 2015.

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2A. CONT'D - APPLICATION BY THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS TO UPDATE AND AMEND THE MUSEUM MARKET PLAZA SPECIFIC PLAN TO REFLECT PREVIOUS APPROVALS AND MODIFICATIONS, INCLUDING CHANGES TO PERMITTED USES FOR CERTAIN BLOCKS WITHIN THE DEVELOPMENT, CHANGES TO THE MAXIMUM PERMITTED HEIGHT FOR CERTAIN BLOCKS WITHIN THE DEVELOPMENT, REDUCTIONS IN THE OVERALL DEVELOPABLE SQUARE FOOTAGE AND PERMITTED NUMBER OF UNITS, AND OTHER VARIOUS ADMINISTRATIVE CHANGES AND CORRECTIONS (CASE NO. 5.1204 SP A-1). (FF)

Planning Director Fagg provided an overview of the proposed update to the Museum Market Plaza Specific Plan.

The Commission discussed and/or requested clarification on the changes.

Commissioners Middleton, Donenfeld, Lowe and Chair Klatchko disclosed they toured the site.

NICOLE CRISTE, Terra Nova Planning, (assisted staff with the preparation of the Specific Plan Amendment and EIR Addendum) provided details regarding Block K-1 and K-2 in the extension of the street.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

JUDY DEERTRACK, said it is not the role of the Planning Commission to make changes to the Specific Plan but rather the people; and indicated that no supporting studies have been provided.

CHUCK STEINMAN said the Specific Plan is lacking a clear definition of the street widths and view corridors and it would be helpful if is incorporated in the document.

STEVEN PRICE, board, Palm Springs Preservation Foundation, requested that the Town and Country Center (T&CC) be removed from the Specific Plan and also requested that the Planning Commission make the same recommendation to the new City Council.

MIKE GUERRA, said he is skeptical as he looks at the construction of Block A; emphasizing that the Specific Plan needs to be right.

ROBERT STONE, questioned why the changes were made to the Specific Plan and encouraged more guidance from the newly elected officials.

EMILY HEMPHILL, legal counsel for Wessman Development, said they are in support of the changes to the Specific Plan and pointed-out that an EIR and back-up studies have been approved for the project.

FRANK TYSEN, spoke in opposition of Block A and commented about an upcoming lawsuit.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

A recess was taken at 3:28 pm.

The meeting reconvened at 3:41 pm.

Vice-Chair Roberts:

- Reduce the maximum number of hotel rooms to 300 rooms.
- Maintain the maximum number of residential units at 650 units.
- Remove Block K from the specific plan document and come back at a later time with a separate project/specific plan for Block K.
- Height of Block B-1 should be no taller than Block B (40') in order to keep the visual break in the development.
- Line 300: Remove the term "interim connection".
- Line 391: Keep the requirement for maximum mass, as well as the discussion on bulk/massing/human scale on lines 417 and 423.
- Line 585: Remove motor scooters and motorbikes as permitted uses; continue to prohibit motorcycle rentals/sales.
- Line 587: Allow vintage store, 2nd hand stores.
- Page III-13: Stepback requirements are still unclear.
- Maintain view corridors, stepbacks.
- Pages IV-1, IV-2: Don't reduce minimum sidewalk dimension, put in what is actual.

Commissioner Weremiuk:

- Remove Block K from the specific plan.
- A parking study should be provided.
- Lines 124-140: Must make findings #1 – #6 for entitlement approvals.
- Line 287: Remove "special events, concerts".

- Line 290: Remove “special events, concerts”.
- Page II-7: Doesn’t understand how numbers are calculated – supports a reduction in the number of hotel rooms.
- Line 554: Supermarket use should be encouraged.
- Table III-1: Consider cannabis uses in the future; require LUP or CUP for vending carts.
- Line 584: Allow motor scooters and electric bikes as a permitted use.
- Line 587: Allow 2nd hand stores.
- Table III-2: Limit height to 17’ on E, H-1, H-2, and clarify if that height would include mechanicals.
- Table III-3: Need explanation of why maximum massing is being eliminated.
- Line 682: Clarification needed on the use of stepbacks or the voids/open airspace at discretion of Planning Commission through Major Architectural Application process.
- Page III-20: Remove the 10’ limitation for awnings; leave restriction about not extending past the back of curb.
- Page III-28: Restrict structures on E, H-1, H-2 to one story in height (except Aluminaire House).
- Comments about EIR Addendum:
 - Sustainability – 50% of buildings should meet LEED certification.
 - Recycling should be provided for the residential units.
 - No discussion of solar.
 - Traffic study – no discussion of Complete Streets policies, bike access and parking.
- Supports Commissioner Donenfeld’s recommendation of including building face to building face distance in table; and supports Commissioner Calderine’s recommendation to add view corridor criteria.
- Need to stake out the sidewalks and street width and tour site.

Commissioner Calderine:

- Document needs an introduction of why the changes are being proposed, list of amendments, and why we’re making these changes.
- Line 140: Add 7th criterion to address view corridors along Main Street, Andreas.
- Page I-6: Provide an explanation as to the change in acreage.
- Line 182: Expand the discussion of the change in height to include the switch between Blocks B & E, amend Line 185.
- Line 301: Also reference the view of the mountain (This important vista...).
- Line 308: Add language that Andreas Road will also provide a view of the mountain.
- Line 364: Oppose the reduction of hotel rooms; supports deferral of AC Marriott, also supports market analysis to justify future hotel rooms – the number of hotels should be limited, not the number of units.

- Table III-2: Should include setback from back of curb (property line) to face of building in addition to setback requirements.
- Section IV should include discussion of Andreas Road (including streetscape requirements).
- Page IV-3: Extension of Main Street through Block K should be identified as “potential”.

Commissioner Middleton:

- Dubious of eliminating Block K, but strong and vigilant of “substantial completion” before any action on K-1, K-2.
- Block K-1, K-2: Need to see Tribe’s plans before determining development plan; Town & Country will be a link, favors restoration and re-use of Town & Country.
- Move forward with residential units.
- The specific plan needs clarity in the width of streets and view corridors.
- Supportive of the reduction in hotel rooms, but not a 50% reduction (25% reduction would be appropriate).
- Line 287: Strike the term “special events, concerts” if redundant, but not if prejudicial.

Commissioner Donenfeld:

- The specific plan needs to specify width of streets, view corridors.
- Need to include a table that discusses the distance from building face to building face, width of streets, width of sidewalks.
- Residential units should be tied to the development of hotel units; require X number of residential units before the next hotel can come online.
- Block K should not be eliminated from the plan, but should not be developed until measurable progress is made with development on west side of Palm Canyon.

Commissioner Lowe:

- Need an economic analysis before approving a reduction in the number of hotel units.

Chair Klatchko:

- Need guidance from consultant on the appropriate number of hotel units and residential units.
- Specific plan document needs to clarify both the setback requirements and the setback requirements.
- Need formal guidance from City Attorney on site visits, contact with developers.

Director Fagg reported that several items that the Commission is in agreement with can be added to the document and brought back for review for the December 9th meeting. He indicated that other items the Commission is not in agreement may need further study.

Commission Weremiuk suggested setting up a subcommittee to work with staff and review the changes.

Vice-Chair Roberts requested the changes the Commission made be brought back to them for review.

ACTION: To continue to a date certain of December 9, 2015; and set up a subcommittee to review the changes to the document. Subcommittee to consist of: Weremiuk and Calerdine.

Motion: Vice-Chair Roberts, seconded by Chair Klatchko and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

A recess was taken at 4:54 pm.

The meeting reconvened at 5:05 pm.

2B. CONT'D - PALM SPRINGS PROMENADE, LLC FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO CONSTRUCT A 6-STORY, 112,862-SQ. FT. RESORT HOTEL CONSISTING OF 142-ROOMS, MEETING SPACE, RESTAURANTS, SPA AND FITNESS CENTER ON BLOCK "B-1" OF THE DOWNTOWN PALM SPRINGS PROJECT LOCATED AT THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF BELARDO ROAD AND MAIN STREET, ZONE CBD (CASE 3.3908 MAJ). (DN)

Chair Klatchko reported that no final action will be taken on this item because it is contingent on Museum Market Plaza Specific Plan update.

Associate Planner Newell presented the proposed resort hotel as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission commented and/or requested details on:

- Setback requirements for massing on the side streets (Andreas, Main and Market Street).

- Number of residential units.
- Could a condition be placed that additional development be limited to residential?
- Building-to-building widths.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

JOHN WESSMAN, Wessman Development, provided background details on the hotel; and spoke about the development plans for the entire project.

CHRIS PARDO, project designer, explained the building-to-building widths (setbacks) and heights throughout the entire development. Mr. Pardo described the view corridors, uses, shade study and elevation perspectives.

JOHN WESSMAN, said they are willing to restrict the total number of hotel rooms to 450 if the Commission desires and commented on the street corner on Tahquitz Canyon.

JUDY DEERTRACK, commented that the CEQA documents that should have been included with this project and spoke about the public expenditure going into this project.

FRANK TYSEN, expressed concern with the height and mass of the development; and urged that an economic and parking study be conducted.

TIM BRUGEMAN, spoke in favor of this hotel; thinks this hotel will support the downtown corridor and his business.

EMILY HEMPHILL, legal consul for Wessman Development, spoke about attracting the tourists for the up-and-coming generation and commented about the funds Wessman has put into this project.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Vice-Chair Roberts requested clarification on the minimum sidewalk widths throughout the development. He commented that projects feels off-balance with all the hotels and very little residential component.

Commissioner Donenfeld spoke about the building-to-building widths and said he is not bothered by the "canyon effect". He does not think people will buy downtown residential units. He is inclined to support this and thinks it is a good addition and it makes sense.

Commissioner Calerdine said this is an appropriate site for the hotel and wants to move forward.

Commissioner Weremiuk commented the findings specify a balance of commercial and residential development that assures an increasing number of residential homes. She expressed concern with 3 hotels together on this corner and cannot support it.

Commissioner Lowe said he likes the hotel; however, he would like to get feedback from the City Council because this is significantly different than was approved in 2009.

ACTION: To continue to a date certain of December 9, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Lowe, seconded by Commissioner Middleton and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

2C. PALM SPRINGS COUNTRY CLUB, LLC, FOR A GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT, PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT IN LIEU OF ZONE CHANGE, MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION AND TENTATIVE TRACT MAP FOR THE REDEVELOPMENT OF APPROXIMATELY 125-ACRES OF PREVIOUSLY DISTURBED VACANT LAND FOR 137 ATTACHED RESIDENCES, 292 DETACHED RESIDENCES, STREETS, PRIVATE OPEN SPACE AND PUBLIC PARK LOCATED NORTH OF VERONA ROAD, EAST OF FARRELL DRIVE, NORTH OF JOYCE DRIVE, EAST OF SUNRISE WAY AND SOUTHWEST OF THE WHITEWATER RIVER WASH, SECTION 36 / TOWNSHIP 3 / RANGE 4, AND SECTION 1 / TOWNSHIP 4 / RANGE 4 (CASE NOS. 5.1327 PD-366, ZC, MAJ AND TTM 36691). (DN)

ACTION: Continue to a date certain of November 18, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Vice-Chair Roberts and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

3. UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

3A. PALM SPRINGS PROMENADE, LLC FOR REVIEW OF THE DOWNTOWN PALM SPRINGS RENOVATION PROJECT LANDSCAPE, HARDSCAPE AND LIGHTING, AS REQUIRED BY PROJECT CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL, GENERALLY LOCATED NORTHWEST TAHQUITZ CANYON WAY AND PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE NOS. 5.1290 PD-361, 3.3605 MAJ, 3.3606 MAJ, 3.3607 MAJ, 3.3785 MAJ). (DN)

Associate Planner Newell provided background information on the proposed landscape, hardscape and lighting concepts for the downtown Museum Market Plaza Specific Plan.

The Commission asked technical questions pertaining to:

- Location and type of bicycle racks.
- How will the planters be placed from a pedestrian standpoint?
- Has the primary tree to the east side of the Kimpton Hotel (archway) been selected?

Commissioner Weremiuk said she was on the subcommittee that reviewed this project and this is a good project and should go forward. She would like to see samples of shade trees on Main Street that are consistent with the trees on Belardo for more shading; and would like to see bike racks.

Vice-Chair Roberts questioned if an area on the street should be delineated for a bike path along Andreas, Main and Belardo; and suggested a recycling plan as a part of this project.

JOHN WESSMAN, applicant, provided details pertaining to the bicycle locations on the property.

TOM DOCZI, landscape architect, provided details on the overall plant palette, pavement transition and public seating and benches. He described the pedestrian street on Market Street (hardscape materials consisting of pavers, site furnishings, shade structures, lighting, planters and benches) and proposed bike rack locations.

ACTION: Approve plans with the following recommendations:

1. Engineering: To incorporate bike lanes on Belardo and bike parking racks into Plan.
2. Site furnishings and lighting to return for review to the AAC and Planning Commission.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Lowe and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

4. NEW BUSINESS:

4A. NEW CHURCH II LLC FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO RENOVATE AND MODIFY EXISTING BUILDINGS AND CONSTRUCT A NEW THREE-STORY BUILDING ON AN APPROXIMATELY TWO-ACRE SITE TO OPERATE A 52-ROOM HOTEL LOCATED AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF BELARDO ROAD AND BARISTO ROAD (CASE 3.0678 MAJ). (DN)

ACTION: Continue to a date certain of November 18, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Vice-Chair Roberts and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

5. OTHER BUSINESS:

5A. WOODBRIDGE PACIFIC GROUP ON BEHALF OF PALM CANYON 65, LLC FOR THE DEMOLITION OF AN EXISTING COMMERCIAL SITE TO CONSTRUCT A MIXED-USE PROJECT ON 12.4-ACRES CONSISTING OF (60) SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES ON LOTS AVERAGING 5,136-SQUARE FEET IN SIZE, (20) MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL CONDOMINIUMS AND APPROXIMATELY 17,872-SQUARE FEET OF COMMERCIAL SPACE LOCATED AT 777 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE NOS. 5.1378 PD-379, ZC 3.3876 MAJ AND TTM 36914). (DN)

ACTION: Continue to a date certain of November 18, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Vice-Chair Roberts and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

PLANNING COMMISSION REPORTS, REQUESTS AND COMMENTS:

No comments.

PLANNING DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

Director Fagg reminded the Commission about the upcoming 2016 Public Meeting Schedule.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Planning Commission adjourned at 7:11 pm to Wednesday, November 18, 2015, at 1:30 pm, City Hall, Council Chamber, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services

DRAFT

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS
PLANNING COMMISSION ADJOURNED MEETING MINUTES
November 18, 2015
Council Chamber, City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way
Palm Springs, CA 92262

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Klatchko called the meeting to order at 1:37 pm.

ROLL CALL:

Present This Meeting: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld,
Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton,
Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts and Chair
Klatchko

Staff Liaisons: Flinn Fagg, AICP, Director of Planning, Michael Daudt, City
Attorney, Marcus Fuller, Assistant City Manager, Terri Hintz,
Planning Administrative Coordinator and David Newell,
Associate Planner

REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA:

The agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Services counter by 9:00 pm on Thursday, November 12, 2015.

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

The agenda was accepted, as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair Klatchko opened public comments:

MIKE GUERRA, (in reference to Item 2A) spoke in support of the development and requested approval.

STEVE HOFFMAN, (in reference to Item 2A) spoke in favor of the Orchid Tree proposal.

FRANK TYSEN, chairman, TRENO, (in reference to Item 2A), spoke in support of the Orchid Tree proposal and urged that projects be built according to the rules.

ALLEN WORTHY, spoke in opposition of the Downtown project and urged more affordable housing in the city be provided.

SETTIE GARVER, (in reference to Item 1A) expressed concern with increased noise and traffic with this development.

There being no further speakers the public comments was closed.

1. PUBLIC HEARING:

1A. PALM SPRINGS COUNTRY CLUB, LLC, FOR A GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT, PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT IN LIEU OF ZONE CHANGE, MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION AND TENTATIVE TRACT MAP FOR THE REDEVELOPMENT OF APPROXIMATELY 125-ACRES OF PREVIOUSLY DISTURBED VACANT LAND FOR 137 ATTACHED RESIDENCES, 292 DETACHED RESIDENCES, STREETS, PRIVATE OPEN SPACE AND PUBLIC PARK LOCATED NORTH OF VERONA ROAD, EAST OF FARRELL DRIVE, NORTH OF JOYCE DRIVE, EAST OF SUNRISE WAY AND SOUTHWEST OF THE WHITEWATER RIVER WASH, SECTION 36 / TOWNSHIP 3 / RANGE 4, AND SECTION 1 / TOWNSHIP 4 / RANGE 4 (CASE NOS. 5.1327 PD-366, ZC, MAJ AND TTM 36691). (DN)

Associate Planner Newell described the existing development and presented the proposed project. He provided an overview of the development including the phasing plan, access roads and conceptual plans.

The Commission commented and/or asked technical questions relating to:

- Alternative road to access the CV link route.
- Proposed off-site traffic improvements and alignment of streets with existing development.
- Height of the mobile homes to the north.
- Details on the outreach neighborhood meetings with adjacent surrounding developments.
- Concern with gated development.
- Phasing and development standards.

Associate Planner Newell directed the Commission to page 9 of the staff report and summarized the public benefits for the project.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

ERIC TAYLOR, applicant, provided details on the history of the golf course, neighborhood outreach meetings, property maintenance, pedestrian and street connectivity and land plan design. Mr. Taylor also described the lot line adjustments, CV link alignment, gates, emergency access roads, building height, design, density and public benefit for the project.

A recess was taken at 3:43 pm.

The meeting reconvened at 3:57 pm.

Chair Klatchko re-opened the public hearing:

TONY BARDEN, commended the applicant for going before the HOA's; however, questioned mitigation issues for increased traffic on Whitewater Club Drive.

DONNA BUCKINGER, said she would be happy to have this gated-community adjacent to her and likes what has been presented so far.

FRED FABRICANT, said there has been no official board action regarding discussion with the applicant regarding property line adjustments and type of fence/wall separating his property.

TERI MC COPPIN, appreciates the idea of development; however, expressed concern with the density (including green area in the wash), increased traffic and water usage.

JIM RUSH, Four Seasons, general manager, said their community will benefit from this development by getting rid of the blowing sand and motorcycles in the abandoned golf course.

BILL BARRY, member, Four Seasons CV Link Committee, spoke in support of Serena Park development; especially, the redirection of the northern CV link through their community and the levy.

DENISE JANSSEN EAGER, expressed concern with the density that will severely impact traffic congestion.

NORA WILLIAMS, president, Alexander Estates II HOA, said a lot has been done to minimize the impact to their homes; however, she expressed concern that nothing has been codified.

KENNETH LEE, does not think this project is low density and the ground coverage should not exceed 35% maximum lot coverage.

RICHARD PEREYRA, said all the roads are up against Palm Springs Country Club and suggested diverting the road to the outer edge of the property.

DEAN WEBER, representing the president of Palm Springs Country Club HOA (phase 1) commented that the developer has been a good neighbor and agreed to what they have asked for. He requested that extreme consideration be given to move this project forward.

VICTOR DUFOUR, spoke in support of the General Plan Amendment and the density is low for this development.

KRISTY ANDERSON, would like the developer to go back to the original plan to mitigate crime and keep her views.

BILL BOWDEN, does not think it will be a great benefit because they will lose the open-space.

CHRIS EAGER, concerned with increased traffic and density of the project.

FRANK TYSEN, on behalf of ABCD (A Better Community for Development) questioned over-development of the city and the benefits to the community.

LES YOUNG, said this development will benefit them from the blowing sand and emphasized that the view is not beautiful.

ERIC TAYLOR, applicant, responded to public testimony, stating that they are willing to put in writing to what they have agreed to for the HOA's.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Chair Klatchko said with the questions from the Commission he's sensing this should come back as a study session for further discussion and suggested each Commissioner submit their questions to the Planning Director.

Commissioner Weremiuk suggested framing the study session as to what they would look at when a golf course is being converted into a different use.

Commissioner Lowe would the Engineering Department take part in this study session with the numerous traffic concerns.

Commissioner Middleton wants to see if it's feasible to extend Barona Road to Gene Autry Trail that would substantially mitigate the traffic heading south in Gene Autry neighborhood. She also emphasized that the developer who has done extraordinary effort reaching out to the community.

The Commission requested the following items:

- Letters from the adjacent HOA's stating if they are in support of this development or their concerns.
- Full-size exhibits are needed to understand this development.
- Provide in writing to the adjacent HOA's what the developer has agreed to do.
- Review standards for ways of maximizing placement of the homes on the lots and placement of swimming pools, etc.
- Updated plans with revisions made.
- Get CVAG's opinion on the CV link.
- A comparison of standards with the proposed Small Lot Ordinance.

ACTION: To continue to a date uncertain to a study session.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine, seconded by Commissioner Donenfeld and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

A five minute recess was taken at 4:52 pm.

The meeting resumed at 4:58 pm.

2. NEW BUSINESS:

2A. NEW CHURCH II LLC FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO RENOVATE AND MODIFY EXISTING BUILDINGS AND CONSTRUCT A NEW THREE-STORY BUILDING ON AN APPROXIMATELY TWO-ACRE SITE TO OPERATE A 52-ROOM HOTEL LOCATED AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF BELARDO ROAD AND BARISTO ROAD (CASE 3.0678 MAJ). (DN)

Associate Planner Newell presented the proposed renovation, partial demolition and construction as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission commented and/or asked technical questions pertaining to:

- Are the three windows hallways along the Belardo elevation?
- How will the tandem parking be used by the hotel guests?
- Commend the applicant for a beautiful project that fits well into the neighborhood.
- Have the issues been resolved with the AAC in terms of the landscape?
- What will happen to the church in the interim?
- Has the minimum landscape been defined?

RICHARD WEINTRAUB, applicant, stated that they received unanimous support from the surrounding neighborhoods. Mr. Weintraub provided details on the parking, windows along the Belardo elevation, landscaping (including a gray water system to allow very lush, exotic plantings) photovoltaic and restoration of the church.

ACTION: Approve, with conditions subject to:

- The landscape to return to the AAC and Planning Commission (consent calendar) with the inclusion if the gray water system can be installed to provide lush landscaping in the interior and xeriscape on the exterior.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Lowe and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Roberts, Chair Klatchko

3. OTHER BUSINESS:

3A. WOODBRIDGE PACIFIC GROUP ON BEHALF OF PALM CANYON 65, LLC FOR THE DEMOLITION OF AN EXISTING COMMERCIAL SITE TO CONSTRUCT A MIXED-USE PROJECT ON 12.4-ACRES CONSISTING OF (60) SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES ON LOTS AVERAGING 5,136-SQUARE FEET IN SIZE, (20) MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL CONDOMINIUMS AND APPROXIMATELY 17,872-SQUARE FEET OF COMMERCIAL SPACE LOCATED AT 777 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE NOS. 5.1378 PD-379, ZC 3.3876 MAJ AND TTM 36914). (DN)

Planning Director Fagg provided a comparison of the proposed small lot ordinance and the proposed development.

TODD CUNNINGHAM, president, Woodbridge Pacific Group, provided details on the site, floor plans, second-floor element, elevations, open-space, and original concept for the trail. Mr. Cunningham addressed the live-work units and parking spaces; noting that the speed limit is 40 miles per hour on Palm Canyon compared to downtown; emphasizing that this area is not walkable and needs to be treated differently.

Vice-Chair Roberts commented and/or requested clarification on:

- Looks like a great project.
- View impacts.
- Retail use and public benefit.

Director Fagg noted that the Cameron project across the street has live/work units and this would saturate the area where there is not a market. He indicated that staff is in support of the commercial space directly on the street and prefers to preserve this

pattern. This is not yet a pedestrian friendly area and would prefer to see parking behind the building.

Commissioner Donenfeld commented that there is no question that it should be retail and the city is not ready for live/work units. He said the buffer is good but thinks it is squeezing the project and would like to see the streets a little wider and more openness.

Commissioner Middleton questioned if the City is looking at a reduction of speed limits in this part of town. She concurred that live/work does not make sense in this area but retail does. She noted that the Cameron project across the street is gated and will be support allowing gates for this project.

MICHAEL KASSINGER, commercial real estate broker, commented on live/work units in the city that have mixed-parking. He explained that's it's his opinion that you cannot mix the parking with commercial and residential because it does not work. A complete separation is needed to provide privacy for the residents.

Chair Klatchko left the Council Chamber at 6:19 pm.

Commissioner Lowe said he was not around when the project across the street was approved in terms of a comparison. He said this is a great project and would like to keep the commercial buildings on front as a continuation of downtown.

Commissioner Weremiuk commented on:

- Prefers to maintain the street pattern.
- Project could be opened up by eliminating two units (i.e. dog park).
- Individual gates for houses on Belardo.

Commissioner Donenfeld preferred parking in front of the retail because of the speed limit on South Palm Canyon - if the nature of the traffic cannot be slowed down.

Commissioner Lowe prefers with parking on the street but noted if it doesn't work he is agreeable to parking in the front.

Commissioner Calderine thinks the bridge widening will increase the speed on South Palm Canyon. He said in general the parking would be more successful in the front and questioned if there is an option for a frontage road.

Vice-Chair Roberts recommended sending this back for the applicant to work with Planning and Engineering staff to resolve the parking issues.

PLANNING COMMISSION REPORTS, REQUESTS AND COMMENTS:

The Commission wished Vice-Chair Roberts the best as a new member of the City Council.

PLANNING DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

None.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Planning Commission adjourned at 6:38 pm to Wednesday, December 9, 2015, at 1:30 pm, City Hall, Council Chamber, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services

DRAFT

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES
December 9, 2015
Council Chamber, City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way
Palm Springs, CA 92262

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Klatchko called the meeting to order at 1:33 pm.

ROLL CALL:

Present This Meeting: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld,
Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton,
Commissioner Weremiuk and Chair Klatchko

Absent This Meeting: None.

Staff Liaisons: Flinn Fagg, Michael Daudt, Marcus Fuller, Terri Hintz,
Ken Lyon, Glenn Mlaker, David Newell and Edward
Robertson

REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA:

The agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Services counter by 6:00 pm on Thursday, December 3, 2015.

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

Chair Klatchko proposed Public Hearing Items 2B and 2C be moved to the end of the agenda (following the New Business items).

Commissioner Weremiuk requested Item 1A, 1C and 1D pulled from the Consent Calendar for further discussion.

The agenda was accepted, as amended.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair Klatchko opened public comments:

FRANK TYSEN, said that the Planning Department recommends approval for all the projects and encouraged the Commission to go very slow on any major decisions to allow the new Council to take a look at what's going on downtown.

CURT WATTS, spoke in reference to Item 2B (Museum Market Plaza Specific Plan) suggested that a 30-day minimum rental period be placed on all or a portion of the residential units to create downtown living.

There being no further comments the public comments was closed.

MICHAEL DAUDT, City Attorney, provided an overview on Ex Parte communications as outlined in the memorandum dated December 7, 2015.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

ACTION: Approve Items 1B and 1E as part of the Consent Calendar.

Motion: Commissioner Lowe, seconded by Commissioner Weremiuk and unanimously carried 6-0 on a roll call vote.

1A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: OCTOBER 28, 2015.

ACTION: Approve minutes of October 28, 2015.

Motion: Commissioner Donenfeld, seconded by Commissioner Calderine and unanimously carried 6-0 on a roll call vote.

1B. CONT'D - WILLIAM BOLLBACH AND MICHAEL CURCIO FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO CONSTRUCT A 4,756-SQUARE FOOT RESIDENCE ON A VACANT HILLSIDE LOT LOCATED AT 818 WEST STEVENS ROAD, ZONE R-1-A (CASE 3.3798 MAJ AND 7.1481 AMM). (DN)

Approved as presented.

1C. DENLAR, LLC FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION FOR A SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A HILLSIDE LOT LOCATED AT 2110 LEONARD ROAD, ZONE R-1-B (CASE 3.3817 MAJ). (KL)

Commissioner Weremiuk requested clarification on the AAC's recommendations.

ACTION: Approve subject to conditions.

Motion: Commissioner Donenfeld, seconded by Commissioner Calerdine and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

1D. MARK TEMPLE REQUESTING A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW FOR A NEW 4,100-SQUARE FOOT HOUSE ON A HILLSIDE LOT; AN ADMINISTRATIVE MINOR MODIFICATION TO INCREASE BUILDING HEIGHT; AND A PARCEL MAP WAIVER REQUEST TO SUBDIVIDE ONE LOT INTO TWO AT 771 LA MIRADA DRIVE, ZONE R-1-A, SECTION 22 (CASE NOS. 3.3914, 7.1489 AMM, PMW 36901). (GM)

Commissioners Weremiuk and Calerdine had technical questions regarding this site.

ACTION: Approve subject to Conditions.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Calerdine and unanimously carried on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

1E. ARRIVE HOTEL REQUESTING A SIGN PROGRAM CONSISTING OF ONE MAIN HOTEL SIGN AND THREE SIGNS FOR ACCESSORY RETAIL USES LOCATED AT 1551 NORTH PALM CANYON DRIVE, (CASE 15-004). (FF)

Approve, as presented.

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2A. DAVIDSON CAMERON 226, LLC, REQUESTS AN AMENDMENT TO ALLOW HEIGHT INCREASE UP TO 6.6 FEET ON CERTAIN UNITS AT A PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT FOR A MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT CONSISTING OF 80 ATTACHED TOWNHOMES, 22 LIVE-WORK UNITS AND 15,000 SQUARE FEET OF RETAIL/COMMERCIAL SPACE LOCATED AT 850-990 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE 5.1056-PDD 314 AMND). (ER)

Principal Planner Robertson presented an overview of the proposed amendment as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission requested clarification and/or commented on:

- Are heights governed by underlying zoning relative to PDD's unless the high-rise ordinance applies?
- Privacy issues - is there an impact from the rooftop decks to the adjacent units?
- Is this the final action?
- What impact do the heights have on the internal/external units (north and part of the west)? (Site sections are included in part of the materials.)

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

TIM O'GRADY, Davidson Communities, applicant, provided details in reference to the increase in height (rooftop decks and stairway system), section elevations, views from the decks, community outreach and public benefits for the project.

BILL POST, thanked the development team for the changes to the wall that borders the Tahquitz Creek and landscape area; and noted several items that have not been addressed.

FRANK TYSEN, said something interesting is needed for the community as a public benefit for the PDD.

JUDY DEERTRACK, expressed concern with not being able to communicate with the Commissioners.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Lowe questioned how the setbacks are measured from the north side that sits on the wash. He asked what is being done with South Palm Canyon to enhance the path.

Commissioner Middleton asked what improvements will be done to enhance the Tahquitz Creek Trail. The applicant pointed-out that the trail was approved 5 years after their project was approved.

Commissioner Donenfeld noted the site lines would not be affected by the increase in height; however, he questioned if the existing neighborhoods would be affected.

Commissioner Weremiuk questioned if there is a community room or swimming pool. Mr. O'Grady described the recreation facility for a meeting space that includes a gym and opens up to a public pool (in addition to private pools).

Commissioner Middleton commented on a memorial that will be placed on the site as part of the public benefit.

Mr. O'Grady expressed concern with imposing conditions on the project in which the Flood Control may preclude from completing the development. He expressed willingness for improvements to the Tahquitz Creek Trail.
Approve subject to Conditions as amended:

ACTION:

1. The applicant shall make a contribution to the Tahquitz Creek Trail improvements the amount shall be determined by staff based on the estimates.

Motion: Commissioner Lowe, seconded by Commissioner Calerdine and unanimously carried 6-0 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

3. NEW BUSINESS:

3A. STANDARD PACIFIC HOMES REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLANS FOR A PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PRELIMINARY PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT 231 TO CONSTRUCT NINETY (90) SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES WITHIN PLANNING AREAS 6 AND 8 OF THE ESCENA PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT LOCATED AT 1000 GENE AUTRY TRAIL, ZONE M-1-P/PDD 231. (ER)

Principal Planner Robertson presented an overview of the proposed final development plans as outlined in the staff report.

Commissioner Weremiuk disclosed that although she resides in the Escena Development and serves on the HOA board; she has confirmed with the City Attorney that there is no conflict.

The Commission requested clarification and/or commented on:

- Conformity determination to the development standards that were previously approved.
- Lot coverage and driveway setbacks are not included.
- Include swimming pools in the landscape plan.

Commissioner Weremiuk expressed concern about whether the project conformed to lot coverage.

ACTION: Approve as recommended.

Motion: Commissioner Donenfeld, seconded by Commissioner Middleton and carried 5-1-0 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Chair Klatchko

NOES: Commissioner Weremiuk

3B. SOUTH PALM CANYON, LLC, REQUEST FOR A ONE-YEAR EXTENSION OF TIME FOR A PREVIOUSLY APPROVED MIXED-USE PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT CONSISTING OF 125 CONDOMINIUM UNITS AND 39,000-SQUARE FEET OF COMMERCIAL SPACE ON 2.67 ACRE SITE LOCATED AT 440-490 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE 5.1042 PD 311). (ER)

Principal Planner Robertson presented the proposed one-year time extension request.

Commissioner Weremiuk commented that they asked in the past to include a letter from the applicant explaining why they have not moved forward in the past year and she does not see it.

ACTION: Continue to a date certain of January 13, 2016.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Lowe.

Further discussion occurred:

Chair Klatchko noted that the applicant has not complied with what the Commission has requested and does not see any efforts in moving forward with this project.

Commissioner Lowe expressed concern about extending another time extension after seven years - for a project that may not be viable. He noted a significant amount of activity is going on surrounding this building.

ROBERT HERSCU, applicant, said he is committed to this project and it is very important to the downtown area. He stated that they are planning to come back with a reconfigured project of half its size and have spent an inordinate amount of money to get approvals and requested more time to bring back a viable project.

Commissioner Middleton noted that if this request is granted they would be coming back 9 months. She said it's time to get this project off the ground and it will be a fundamentally different project.

Commissioner Weremiuk said she was the biggest proponent the last time the Commission reviewed this but with the lack of action this year she feels this has gone on long enough. She withdrew her motion.

ACTION: To deny.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Lowe and carried 4-2-0 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

NOES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Middleton

3C. CDI VENTURES, LLC, REQUESTING A ONE-YEAR EXTENSION OF TIME FOR A PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT (PDD 333) FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF A 200-ROOM HOTEL, 50 HIGH-END RESIDENTIAL UNITS AND A PARKING STRUCTURE LOCATED AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF AVENIDA CABALLEROS AND AMADO ROAD, (CASE 5.1132-PD 333) (ER).

Commissioner Calerdine noted a property-related conflict of interest and would not be participating in the discussion or vote.

Principal Planner Robertson presented the request for a one-year time extension.

Commissioner Weremiuk noted that there has been delay because of the land transfer from the Redevelopment Agency and questioned if there is a reclaim provision for the City if this project does not move forward.

Commissioner Lowe concurred that this is a valid reason and supports the time extension.

ACTION: Approve the one-year time extension.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Donenfeld and carried 5-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Calerdine.

3D. RECOVERY INNOVATIONS, INC., REQUESTING A MODIFICATION TO THE CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL FOR AN OUTPATIENT BEHAVIORAL HEALTH

OFFICE, LOCATED AT 2500 NORTH PALM CANYON DRIVE, (CASE LUP 15-038) (FF).

Planning Director Fagg provided an overview on the request to modify a condition of approval.

JAMIE SELLAR, applicant, provided further details and was available for questions from the Commission.

Commissioner Lowe concurred with staff to allow the Planning Department to monitor the applicant's compliance and handle any nuisance issues especially if this business will not open because of the requirement imposed by the Commission.

Commissioner Donenfeld was in favor of encouraging the applicant to open this type of mental health facility. He questioned if the conditions of approval would meet their concerns.

Commissioner Lowe questioned if 24-hour security monitoring could be imposed.

Commissioner Weremiuk said she is not comfortable giving up the ability to request a review and prefers to hold on to it.

Commissioner Middleton said she preferred to have the opportunity to review the project but does not want to see it fail because of a condition imposed by the Commission - she will support the request.

ACTION: Approve as amended:

- Delete the requirement for a six-month review by the Planning Commission.
- Add a condition for a six-month review by the Planning Department and provide a report to the Planning Commission consisting of calls for service to the police department.
- Add a condition that applicant shall submit an operational plan detailing security procedures and submit to the Police Department for review.

Motion: Commissioner Lowe, seconded by Commissioner Middleton and unanimously carried 5-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Calerdine

A recess was taken at 4:24 pm. The meeting reconvened at 4:40 p.m.

2B. CONT'D - APPLICATION BY THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS TO UPDATE AND AMEND THE MUSEUM MARKET PLAZA SPECIFIC PLAN TO REFLECT PREVIOUS APPROVALS AND MODIFICATIONS, INCLUDING CHANGES TO PERMITTED USES FOR CERTAIN BLOCKS WITHIN THE DEVELOPMENT, CHANGES TO THE MAXIMUM PERMITTED HEIGHT FOR CERTAIN BLOCKS WITHIN THE DEVELOPMENT, REDUCTIONS IN THE OVERALL DEVELOPABLE SQUARE FOOTAGE AND PERMITTED NUMBER OF UNITS, AND OTHER VARIOUS ADMINISTRATIVE CHANGES AND CORRECTIONS (CASE NO. 5.1204 SP A-1). (FF)

Director Fagg provided an overview of the proposed changes and noted that the subcommittee met on December 7, 2015 consisting of (Weremiuk and Calerdine) to review the proposed changed and come back with recommendations. Director Fagg summarized the proposed changes discussed in the subcommittee meeting.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

TIM ELLIS, PS Resorts, vice-president, they are very concerned with adding another hotel to the overall market place. Mr. Ellis indicated that they are not in support of building the hotel right now but can support it if built at a future date - @ a 62% occupancy or in five years.

FRANK TYSEN, commented on a letter from the ABCD attorney recommending that no action be taken today and continue to a future date.

JOHN WESSMAN, Wessman Development, commented that the view corridor (building-to-building setback) on Belardo should be 70 feet not 75 feet; and provided details on the view corridors, residential units and building setbacks.

TRAE DANIEL, encouraged re-naming the downtown development and noted that there is no over arching vision for what the city wants to become.

ROBERT BRUGEMAN, said he had no business from the parade on Palm Canyon (3rd Saturday from Christmas) and requested approval; reiterating the need to attract tourists for high-end retail.

EMILY HEMPHIL, legal consul representing the applicant, stated that it's not the numbers of rooms but the product you get with these rooms. Ms. Hemphill addressed the suggested change from the Commission in reference to Block K-1 and K-2.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Lowe made the following comments:

- In the introduction: Commercial/retail with some residential (instead of more residential) needs to be addressed.
- Line 24: Why the name change?
- Line 152: Is not pedestrian oriented.
- Line 354: Indicates too many residential units (650 rooms) - it is physically impossible and should be reduced.
- Chart III-7: Second-hand stores are too or a general description- more upscale is appropriate.
- Page 111-30: More helpful to public to have actual photos of actual buildings that have been approved.

Commissioner Middleton made the following comments:

- Line 308: Should not eliminate "special events/concerts" (so we can have opera in the downtown park) and add: Special Events, Musical Theater.
- Line 354: Number of residential units - what is a realistic number of residential units and where will they is located?
- Line 355: Hotel Rooms - a 3rd hotel is becoming very problematic in this downtown location.
- Block K1/K2: Needs to be preserved until clarity from the Tribe is received.

Commissioner Weremiuk commented on:

- The number of hotel rooms for Phase 1/Phase II up to 300 units.
- Allow a height increase of 75 feet for the Park Hotel if the Marriott Hotel is not constructed.
- Need new planning for Block K1/K2.
- Encourage residential without destroying public uses - gym, etc.
- Sadden about the loss of parking on Palm Canyon.
- Open to discussion regarding maximum height on Blocks B, G and A-1; and likes the idea of preserving the view corridors.

Commissioner Donenfeld commented on:

- How many hotel rooms? How many hotels? How many residential?
- Three hotels are too many for the project- two hotels are sufficient.
- Limit hotel rooms to 300 and prefers the Park Hotel where it is.
- Block K1 and K2: postpone until Phase 1 and II are underway.
- Increase opportunities for residential.

Commissioner Calderine made the following comments:

- Supports the concept of the Park Hotel over the Marriott A/C.
- Limit the number of the hotel rooms for the first five years.

- Supports allowing the increased height for Block B-1.
- Amenable to height increase for Block G - if residential with a careful look at how the corridor changes along Andreas.
- Block K1 and K2: evaluate if the buildings are feasible for restoration.
- What is the cost for the restoration and who will pay?

Chair Klatchko made the following comments:

- Block K1 and K2: Is the existing language sufficient? Is the proposed language too restrictive?
- The number of residential and hotel units are determined by the marketplace.
- Page 212 and 313: Proposed height restrictions and final action by the City Council.
- Setback on Belardo - ok with 70 feet.

Commissioner Lowe left the Council Chamber at 6:33 pm for the remainder of the meeting.

ACTION: Approve the Museum Market Plaza Specific Plan Update subject to the Subcommittee finalizing changes and forward to the City Council Council including:

- Subcommittee to meet next week to finalize the changes and forward to the City Council.
- Block K1 and K2: Keep existing language. Provide new Specific Plan or feasibility of preservation (include some Planning).
- Number of hotel rooms: Building permits for up to 300 hotel rooms and 2 hotels may be issued at this time subject to market conditions. Up to 450 rooms at a later phase if there's proof of demand (62% occupancy).
- Allow greater height on Blocks D, G and A-1 for residential uses; reduce to 40 feet for commercial uses.
- Allow 75 feet on Block B-1.

Motion: Commissioner Calerdine seconded by Commissioner Middleton and carried 4-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calerdine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Middleton, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Lowe

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Weremiuk.

Commissioner Weremiuk stated that she was not sure they were clear enough.

C. CONT'D - PALM SPRINGS PROMENADE, LLC FOR A MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO CONSTRUCT A 6-STORY, 112,862-SQ. FT. RESORT HOTEL CONSISTING OF 142-ROOMS, MEETING SPACE, RESTAURANTS, SPA AND FITNESS CENTER ON BLOCK "B-1" OF THE DOWNTOWN PALM SPRINGS PROJECT LOCATED AT THE NORTHEAST CORNER OF BELARDO ROAD AND MAIN STREET, ZONE COD (CASE 3.3908 MAJ). (DN)

ACTION: Continue to a date certain of January 13, 2016.

Motion: Commissioner Donenfeld seconded by Commissioner Middleton and unanimously carried 5-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Calderine, Commissioner Donenfeld, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Lowe

PLANNING COMMISSION REPORTS, REQUESTS AND COMMENTS: None.

PLANNING DIRECTOR'S REPORT: None.

ADJOURNMENT: The Planning Commission adjourned at 7:00 pm to Wednesday, January 13, 2016, at 1:30 pm, City Hall, Council Chamber, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services