

CITY OF PALM SPRINGS
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES
April 13, 2016
Council Chamber, City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way
Palm Springs, CA 92262

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Klatchko called the meeting to order at 1:33 pm.

ROLL CALL:

Present This Meeting: Commissioner Hirschbein, Commissioner Lowe,
Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-
Chair Calerdine, Chair Klatchko

Absent This Meeting: Commissioner Donenfeld

Staff Present: Flinn Fagg, Marcus Fuller, Michael Daudt, Terri Hintz, David
Newell

REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA:

The agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Services counter by 7:00 pm on Thursday, April 7, 2016.

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

The agenda was accepted, as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Chair Klatchko opened public comments:

NORA WILLIAMS, Alexander Estates, Phase IV, president, said they have worked hard on their issues with the developer and spoke in support of the project.

KATHLEEN ADAMS, resides to adjacent to the new Skye Development and the proposed Palm Canyon project, spoke in opposition of Item 2A, said the Skye

development is very different than how it was projected and the neighborhood is very discouraged.

KENNETH FALCOM, Historic Tennis Club resident, spoke in reference of Item 2A, said the hillside developments should be scrutinized more carefully on the overall site and suggested accurate elevations be submitted for the proposed project.

RON HALLERAH, The Canyons resident, spoke in reference Skye Development, said his back wall abuts this new development and the lots behind his property are significantly higher. He is requesting that lots #5 and #6 be lowered.

DICK OBYETER, The Canyons resident, said his home abuts the Skye Development and the heights of the homes are very high and this was not the way it was proposed.

There being no further appearances public comments was closed.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

1A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: MARCH 14, 2016 STUDY SESSION AND MARCH 23, 2016 REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

ACTION: Approve, as submitted.

Motion: Vice-Chair Calerdine, seconded by Commissioner Lowe and carried 5-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Calerdine, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Donenfeld

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Hirschbein.

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2A. WOODBRIDGE PACIFIC GROUP ON BEHALF OF PALM CANYON 65, LLC, FOR PLANNED DEVELOPMENT IN LIEU OF ZONE CHANGE, TENTATIVE TRACT MAP AND MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION TO CONSTRUCT A MIXED-USE PROJECT ON 12.4-ACRES CONSISTING OF (57) SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCES ON LOTS AVERAGING 5,362-SQUARE FEET IN SIZE, (22) MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL CONDOMINIUMS AND APPROXIMATELY 15,893-SQUARE FEET OF COMMERCIAL SPACE LOCATED AT 777 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE (CASE NOS. 5.1378 PD-379, ZC 3.3876 MAJ AND TTM 36914). (DN)

Associate Planner Newell presented the proposed development as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission requested clarification on the following items:

- The total amount of retail off-street parking on Palm Canyon.
- What elements of the Tahquitz Creek Trail will be provided with this project?
- What are the changes to the proposed alternate plan - (it eliminates the commercial with enhanced landscape buffer).
- Analysis of the General Plan.
- Development Standards.
- The plans to connect the Tahquitz Creek Trail to the Cameron project.
- The pools and water conservation.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

-TODD CUNNINGHAM, applicant, provided details on the viability of the commercial in this location and issues associate with it. He described the all-residential plan including the footprint, elevations, height, setbacks and floor plans.

FRANK TYSEN, spoke about the lack of public benefit for planned developments and is opposed to the swimming pools for the homes; he urged the Commission to send this back to lower the density.

KATHLEEN ADAMS, The Canyons resident, expressed concern about the zoning, density and height of this project and how it will impact the neighborhood.

KENNETH FALCON, thinks it's important to keep the pedestrian access because of the activity coming from the new hotel in this area.

MARIO GONZALES, developer, does not think the commercial component will work in this location and the residential makes sense. He believes that a lot of the comments made today could be easily addressed and requested approval of the 3rd plan.

TODD CUNNINGHAM said they are in full compliance with the landscape plan for the Tahquitz Creek Trail and addressed the continuous wall on the north side.

There being no further speakers the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Weremiuk said she prefers the 3rd plan and made the following comments:

- The sideyard setbacks at 5 ft. are not acceptable and need to be 10 ft.
- The restrooms in the community pool area can be unisex.

- More green space is needed - (possibly losing unit #1 that's adjacent to the pool to encourage use and gathering space for people in the community and an access gate to the trail).
- Appreciates that the streets are normal width and cars can park in the driveway.
- Lots are a little too small.

Commissioner Middleton noted that a year ago the Mac Magruder Chevrolet Building and Rock Garden were still in place and occupied illegally. She thinks the project is too dense but noted that there is a lot to like about this project especially completion of the Tahquitz Creek Trail. She favored the all-residential option for this location and agreed that the sideyard setbacks should be 10 ft.

Commissioner Hirschbein made the following comments:

- Minimum R-1 requirement for lot size; maximum of 35% lot coverage.
12 ft. buffer to property line from wall leading to the trail.
- More architectural design on the south corner of the development (coming over the bridge).
- Project to return to the AAC.
- Design of the houses need to be more sophisticated.

Commissioner Calerdine said he is happy with the 5 ft. separation and supports the project.

Chair Klatchko said he likes the 24' height on the multi-family and asked staff for clarification if bike lanes are allowed Palm Canyon. He noted that there is minimal landscape along Belardo Road and enhancing it or widening could provide public benefit. He agreed the project should go back to the AAC for the new multi-family plans for review.

ACTION: Continue to date certain of May 11, 2016.

Motion: Vice-Chair Calerdine, seconded by Commissioner Lowe and unanimously carried 6-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Hirschbein, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Calerdine, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Donenfeld

A recess was taken at 3:03 pm.

The meeting resumed at 3:17 pm.

2B. SERENA PARK - PALM SPRINGS COUNTRY CLUB, LLC, FOR A GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT, PLANNED DEVELOPMENT DISTRICT IN LIEU OF ZONE CHANGE, MAJOR ARCHITECTURAL APPLICATION AND TENTATIVE TRACT MAP FOR THE REDEVELOPMENT OF APPROXIMATELY 125-ACRE OF PREVIOUSLY DISTURBED VACANT LAND FOR 137 ATTACHED RESIDENCES, 292 DETACHED RESIDENCES, STREETS, PRIVATE OPEN SPACE AND PUBLIC PARK LOCATED NORTH OF VERONA ROAD, EAST OF FARRELL DRIVE, NORTH OF JOYCE DRIVE, EAST OF SUNRISE WAY AND SOUTHWEST OF THE WHITEWATER RIVER WASH, SECTION 36 / TOWNSHIP 3 / RANGE 4, AND SECTION 1 / TOWNSHIP 4 / RANGE 4 (CASE NOS. 5.1327 PD-366, ZC, MAJ AND TTM 36691). (DN)

Associate Planner Newell provided an overview of the proposed development as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission asked technical questions pertaining:

- Have the dimensions for the lots changed on the alternate plan?
- What is the Public Benefit?
- Details on the traffic control at Farrell Drive and Racquet Club.
- Status of public park.
- Acquiring access points on Golden Sand and Whitewater Country and relocating the gate.
- Attainment of fees for open-space.
- Transfer of density.
- Mitigation measures.
- The City work with the developer and Tribe to obtain access from Verona to Gene Autry for the construction.
- Details on the CV Link.

Chair Klatchko opened the public hearing:

ERIC TAYLOR, applicant, Serena Park, addressed questions from the Commission regarding: streets, mitigation of construction traffic, the park, the Whitewater access connection, CV Link (pedestrian & bike path), lot widths, setbacks and the alternate plan.

The following persons spoke in *opposition* of the proposed project:

KENNETH MAU, Gene Autry Neighborhood, chairman, expressed concern with the traffic access going through their neighborhood and urged the Commission to put this on hold until the issues are resolved.

RENEE SAUNDERS, resides on Verona Road, expressed concern with traffic and loss of views and suggested reducing the density of the project.

JERRY COLLAMER, resides adjacent to the old 18th fairway, spoke about traffic congestion, loss of open-space and urged more study be done.

JEFF DI AVANZO, spoke about the density and urged the Commission to reconsider amending the General Plan designation.

DONALD BROODHURST, concerned with access points into Verona and Whitewater Country Club and suggested using other streets.

DAN HUGHETT, spoke about the entrance issues that will add traffic congestion; he suggested leaving the site as a park.

TERI MC COPLIN, PS Country Club HOA, said a very low density project is actually too dense to absorb and could increase the potential of flooding to her neighborhood.

RONALD HERISKO, PS Country Club, board member, Phase III, expressed concern with the increased homes that will greatly increase the traffic congestion and suggested decreasing the number of homes.

The following persons spoke in *favor* of the proposed project:

ROGER CONWAY, resides adjacent to Golden Sands, said that a public benefit for him will be the end of bike races and random gun shots behind his residence. He requested expeditious approval of the project.

DIANA GRACE, Four Seasons, treasurer & board of directors member, Four Seasons, submitted letters from many the homeowners in favor of this project because of increase in property values, elimination of defunct golf course, blowing sand and noted that it will enhance the city as a whole.

VICTOR DEFOE, Whitewater Condominiums, Phase II, said the board is not in favor of transferring or selling their streets for access to this development. However, he thinks the benefits of this development outweigh the detriments.

There being no further appearances the public hearing was closed.

Chair Klatchko asked the applicant if they considered expanding the park area to keep the open-space in this community.

ACTION: Approve the project, subject to the following additional conditions:

1. Traffic
 - a. Accept Golden Sands as a public street.
 - b. "Spine" road through the project is to be a public street.
 - c. A minimum of three points of access shall be required to the project, with the preference for the additional entrance at Farrell/Racquet Club (with the applicant to provide a new gate for residents of Palm Springs Country Club); alternate choice for third point of access is Francis Drive.
 - d. Traffic mitigation to be provided at Farrell/Racquet Club, and at Whitewater Club Drive and Vista Chino.

Finding: Without the provision of a third access point to the development, there will be an unfair traffic burden to the adjoining neighborhoods.

2. Construction Issues
 - a. A construction phasing plan shall be required at the Final PD review.
 - b. The City shall work with the landowner southeast of the project site to provide temporary construction access through to Gene Autry.
 - c. The "spine" road shall be built out as a construction road from Golden Sands to Whitewater Club Drive; full completion of the "spine" road shall be required at the completion of Phase I of the development.
 - d. Construction traffic shall be prohibited from traveling through residential neighborhoods on Via Escuela, Whitewater Club Drive, and Verona Road.
3. Environmental
 - a. Applicant shall be required to adhere to Engineering Condition #43 relative to flood control issues.
 - b. The applicant shall be required to adhere to Mitigation Measure 4.2-9 relative to wind fencing around construction sites and maintenance of dust control over the entire site.
 - c. The applicant shall be required to provide appropriate mitigation of any hazardous materials found on the site.
4. Density
 - a. Fifty percent (50%) of the site shall be retained as open space; in determining the open space, the 25 acres within the Whitewater Wash may be included in the calculation. Amenities such as private parks, public parks, greenbelts, CV Link trails, and other similar amenities may be included in the required open space areas.
 - b. The total number of units shall be reduced to 386 units, representing a 10% decrease.

Finding: There is a disparate impact of not following the grid model of traffic dispersal and impacts to adjoining neighborhoods; reducing density will assist in reducing traffic impacts.

5. CV Link

- a. A trail shall be provided through the property whether CV Link approves the alignment. The trail shall have a 24' right-of-way in a 50' wide greenbelt.
- b. The applicant shall consider moving the alignment of the trail along the levee for the southern portion of the project.
- c. The proposed street along Joyce Drive shall be moved further away from the existing homes so as to accommodate the trail alignment.
- d. Allow a pedestrian gate from the Golden Sands Trailer Park to the trail, and allow a pedestrian gate from Savannah Way to the trail if desired by the residents of Four Seasons development.

6. Open Space

- a. The applicant shall donate the 25 acres within the Whitewater Wash to the City.
- b. The levee shall be improved as park or trail area, and count towards the open space requirement.

7. Landscape

- a. Landscape plans shall be reviewed and approved as part of the Final PD application.

8. Gates

- a. The "spine" road and the three access points shall not be gated.
- b. Only the age-restricted portion of the development shall be allowed to have restricted access gates.

9. Sidewalks

- a. Public streets shall be required to have sidewalks along at least one side of the street.
- b. The age-restricted portion of the development shall also be required to have sidewalks.

10. Age-Restricted Housing

- a. The hammerhead design shall be eliminated in favor of c-shaped or u-shaped access driveways.

11. Parking

- a. In the age-restricted portion of the development, guest parking shall be provided if streets aren't wide enough to accommodate on-street parking.
12. Unit Design
 - a. Review and approval of the unit design standards shall be deferred to the Final PD application. The architecture of the units should reference the design of the Alexander Estates or the Cody-designed units within the Palm Springs Country Club.
 - b. The maximum height of the residential units shall be limited to 19'.
 - c. A minimum 10' setback shall be required for all products except the age-restricted portion of the development, with a preference for zero-lot line or use easements to maximize use of the side-yard space.
 - d. The perimeter wall around the Palm Springs Country Club shall be one consistent wall type, which shall be reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission as part of the Final PD application.
 13. Park
 - a. A public park shall be provided within the development, and shall be maintained by the HOA.
 14. Residential Amenities
 - a. No residential amenities are currently shown on the proposed site plan; a proposal for residential amenities, including parks and other recreational amenities, shall be submitted for review and approval by the Planning Commission.
 - b. A common clubhouse and pool shall be provided in the age-restricted portion of the development.
 15. Public Benefit. In accordance with the adopted City Council policy, the following items shall be considered as public benefits:
 - a. CV Link trail alignment or other public access path through the site.
 - b. Provision of 50% open space.
 - c. Public through-street ("spine" road).
 - d. Park (maintained by HOA).
 - e. Conservation measures:
 - 1) Additional water conservation such as gray water systems (plumb and offer as an option).
 - 2) Provide a percentage of solar power for units (such as 40% of usage capacity).
 - 3) All landscape lighting and outdoor lighting shall utilize LED fixtures.
 - 4) All structures shall conform to the Green for Life building program "Green Tree" level.
 16. Development Agreement

- a. This approval shall be conditioned upon the applicant entering into a development agreement with the City.
17. Agreements with Adjacent HOA's/Neighborhood Organizations
- a. The applicant's agreements with any adjacent HOA/neighborhood organization shall be memorialized as part of this approval.

Motion: Commissioner Weremiuk, seconded by Commissioner Middleton and carried 5-1-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Calderine, Chair Klatchko
NOES: Commissioner Hirschbein
ABSENT: Commissioner Donenfeld

2C. SERENA PARK - PALM SPRINGS COUNTRY CLUB LLC, FOR A DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT RELATED TO THE REDEVELOPMENT OF APPROXIMATELY 125-ACRE OF PREVIOUSLY DISTURBED VACANT LAND FOR 137 ATTACHED RESIDENCES, 292 DETACHED RESIDENCES, STREETS, PRIVATE OPEN SPACE AND PUBLIC PARK LOCATED NORTH OF VERONA ROAD, EAST OF FARRELL DRIVE, NORTH OF JOYCE DRIVE, EAST OF SUNRISE WAY AND SOUTHWEST OF THE WHITEWATER RIVER WASH, SECTION 36 / TOWNSHIP 3 / RANGE 4, AND SECTION 1 / TOWNSHIP 4 / RANGE 4 (CASE NOS. 5.1327 DA). (DN)

ACTION: Continue Items 2C and 3A to a date certain of April 27, 2016.

Motion: Commissioner Middleton, seconded by Commissioner Weremiuk and unanimously carried 6-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Hirschbein, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Calderine, Chair Klatchko
ABSENT: Commissioner Donenfeld

3. NEW BUSINESS:

3B. RUDY DVORAK AND CLIVE WILKINSON REQUEST TO ABANDON AND VACATE A PUBLIC UTILITY EASEMENT WITHIN A VACATED PORTION OF PATENCIO ROAD; BETWEEN LINDA VISTA DRIVE AND RAMON ROAD, IN SECTION 15, TOWNSHIP 4 SOUTH, RANGE 4 EAST, S.B.M., (ENGINEERING FILE R 15-14). (ER)

Item was tabled.

3A. PALM SPRINGS PROMENADE, LLC, OWNER, TO ESTABLISH A SIGN PROGRAM FOR THE BLOCK A BUILDING LOCATED WITHIN THE MUSEUM MARKET PLAZA SPECIFIC PLAN AT THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF PALM CANYON DRIVE AND ANDREAS ROAD, ZONE CBD, SECTION 15 (CASE SP 16-002). (DN)

ACTION: Continue Items 2C and 3A to a date certain of April 27, 2016.

Motion: Commissioner Middleton, seconded by Commissioner Weremiuk and unanimously carried 6-0-1 on a roll call vote.

AYES: Commissioner Hirschbein, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Middleton, Commissioner Weremiuk, Vice-Chair Calderine, Chair Klatchko

ABSENT: Commissioner Donenfeld

PLANNING COMMISSION REPORTS, REQUESTS AND COMMENTS: None.

PLANNING DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

Planning Director Fagg reminded the Planning Commission of the upcoming Joint Meeting with the Architectural Advisory Committee, Planning Commission and City Council on April 20, 2016 to discuss the changes to the Downtown Specific Plan.

ADJOURNMENT:

The Planning Commission adjourned at 5:54 pm to 1:30 pm on Wednesday, April 27, 2016, City Hall, Council Chamber, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services