

DRAFT

HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

Large Conference Room, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way, Palm Springs, California 92262
www.palmspringsca.gov

MINUTES

April 9, 2019



9:00 AM
REGULAR MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL: Chair Burkett, Vice-Chair Hays, Members Dixon, La Voie, Kiser.

ABSENT: Member Marsh (excused)

2018 / 2019 – Attendance Record										
Name	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr
Gary Johns	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dick Burkett	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Todd Hays	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Bill La Voie	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Katherine Hough			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Dan Kiser	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Linda Dixon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Vincent Marsh	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

M/S/C: La Voie / Dixon, to accept the agenda as presented (6-0-1 Marsh absent).

PUBLIC COMMENT:

(There were no speakers during public comment.)

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

1.A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: MARCH 12, 2019 HSPB MEETING.

M/S/C Dixon / La Voie to approve the minutes (6-0-1 Marsh absent).

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2.A. THE PALM SPRINGS PRESERVATION FOUNDATION ("PSPF") REQUESTING CLASS 1 HISTORIC RESOURCE DESIGNATION FOR "INSPIRATION POINT" (AKA "THE PROMONTORY") LOCATED AT THE WESTERN TERMINUS OF WEST CHINO DRIVE, CASE HSPB #115. (APN'S 513-070-006 AND 505-312-007), ZONE "O" AND R-1-A, (KL).

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report noting that staff does not recommend that the flat plateau portion of the promontory be identified as "contributing" to allow the property owner the opportunity in the future to potentially develop the plateau as a homesite. He explained that in recent discussions with the property owner, it was requested that the rock wall associated with the access road also not be identified as a "contributing element" to allow it to be removed in the future in order to increase the load capacity of the road for future development and fire department access.

Member La Voie asked the width of the road bed (Lyon replied roughly 18 feet). He asked how much of the road would need to be widened to accommodate fire department access. (Lyon explained the road improvements have not been engineered, but he believed most of the roadbed would need to be widened to around 24 feet from Chino Drive to the promontory.) Member La Voie asked about the length of the road (Lyon replied 2,100 feet total, roughly 800 feet to the point where the road splits.) Member La Voie asked about turn-around space needed at the top of the road (Lyon explained it depended on the type of turn-around; a "hammerhead" would require less space than a typical "cul de sac".)

Member Dixon asked if the rock wall at the road was exempted, how would the rest of the road be improved? (Lyon stated where there is no rock wall along the road, the road would likely be widened by both cut into the mountain and fill on the outer edge of the road.)

Member Dixon asked for clarification on what roads are part of the board's consideration (Lyon stated only the direct road to the promontory is under consideration, the other roads to the lower lots is not part of the proposed designation).

Member Dixon asked when development was approved for the parcels (Lyon explained no development has ever been submitted for City consideration for the promontory or the lower hillside lots).

Member La Voie asked about a turn out about mid-way up the road (Lyon explained it is likely a spur that goes down to another buildable lot).

Member Hays asked for clarification that if the flat plateau was not contributing it could be potentially built upon? (Lyon replied yes.)

Member Kiser asked if the owner supports the proposed designation. (Lyon replied the property owner will express themselves and noted they wanted to be sure the buildability of the plateau would not be blocked by the proposed designation.)

Member Dixon asked about the City's ordinances regulating building on hillside areas. (Lyon explained most hillside lots are buildable except areas where slopes are greater than 30%.)

The Chair opened the public hearing.

Jan Harper, representing the Palm Springs Preservation Foundation ("PSPF") spoke in support of the nomination.

Scott Lyle, representing the property owner, Old Las Palmas LLC, noted the owner would like to support the designation, but requests that the entire roadway will be exempted from the list of contributing features so it is possible for it to be removed and the roadway widened. Also a portion of the perimeter wall at the north side of the promontory be exempted to create a fire department turn-around and the flat pad of the promontory itself be exempted.

Member Hays asked for clarification of the portion of the north wall that the owner is requesting be exempted (Mr. Lyle pointed out the area on the photo.)

Charles Brobeck, representing the O'Donnell Golf Club Board, supports the nomination.

Steven Vaught, PSPF spoke in support of the nomination, highlighted features of the report and noted he wrote the historic resources report.

Member La Voie asked Mr. Vaught about the impacts of not preserving the plateau of the promontory. (Mr. Vaught noted it is highly visible and is often asked about by tourists. He opined that whatever might be built on the promontory should remain sensitive to the aesthetic of the site. He referenced the Thomas O'Donnell House built on a similar promontory south of the subject site.)

Seeing no further speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Member Hays asked if a future development project were to come into the City, would the HSPB review it (Lyon responded yes.)

Member La Voie opined that the open space of the platform should be identified as a contributing feature and remain open and undeveloped. Regarding the wall along the road, he felt the rock wall and the road from the turnout of the first spur road to the promontory should be protected and any restoration of the wall above the spur road should be redone in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

Member Kiser opined that he felt the platform should be buildable. He supports the nomination and that the board should have the opportunity to review future development.

Member Hough stated she supports the proposed nomination.

Member Dixon stated she does not believe the promontory should be built upon and that it doesn't seem appropriate to allow the mountain to be cut into in order to widen the road for fire trucks.

M/S/C La Voie / Dixon; (1) to accept the staff report and recommend that the City Council designate the parcel as a Class 1 historic resource, (2) that the promontory platform itself be listed as a character-defining feature, (3) that the road and wall from the first spur road to the promontory be included as a character-defining feature and any restoration of that portion of the roadway wall be undertaken in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards, (4) that the road and wall from the entry gate at Chino Road to the first spur road be allowed to be modified for widened roads for access to the lower lots. (4-2-1; Hough, Hays opposed, Marsh absent).

Member Hays asked with the inclusion of the flat pad as a character-defining feature, would it still be buildable? (Director Fagg noted the ordinance provides guidance for alterations to Class 1 resources and a future board would need to evaluate the proposed development's impacts on the listed contributing features.)

**2.B. THE PALM SPRINGS PRESERVATION FOUNDATION ("PSPF")
REQUESTING CLASS 1 HISTORIC RESOURCE DESIGNATION OF "THE
AVERY FIELD CABIN RUINS" LOCATED ON A 1.56-ACRE PARCEL AT THE
WESTERN TERMINUS OF SANTA ROSA DRIVE, CASE HSPB #114 (KL).**

Staff Lyon summarized the staff report.

Member La Voie asked if designating the site would prohibit future development of the site (Staff Lyon replied no.) He asked if designated, would future development need to be reviewed by the HSPB? (Lyon replied yes.)

Member Hough asked about steel window frames laying on the ground and what would happen with those loose parts if the site were designated. (Staff Lyon noted the steel parts were not included because it could not be confirmed that they were an integral part of the cabin.)

Member La Voie asked if there could be an archaeological investigation of the site to reveal any potential trash sites or other artifacts. (Lyon replied yes it could be done, but one has not been done as part of this application.)

The Chair opened the public hearing.

Jan Harper representing PSPF spoke in support of the nomination.

Steve Vaught, representing PSPF spoke in support of the nomination and wrote the historic resources report. He noted that the cabin was in ruins as early as the 1950's.

Member La Voie asked if Mr. Vaught had opinions on the source of the original building materials (He opined that it was locally sourced.)

Jim Franklin representing the owner John Beardsley noted they support the proposed nomination. Mr. Franklin asked if the owners can restrict access to the public to the site (Lyon replied yes.)

Member Hough asked where a possible marker would be located. (Lyon stated it would be placed where it is viewable from the public right-of-way.)

Seeing no other speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Member Hough stated she would support the nomination.

Member Kiser stated he would support the nomination.

Member La Voie stated he would support the nomination and that the site should be preserved and maintained as a ruin in its present state. He opined that a historic marker would benefit from showing an image of the cabin from its period of significance.

Member Hays stated he would support the nomination and agreed a custom marker showing a graphic of the cabin would be informative.

Member Dixon stated her support of the nomination.

M/S/C La Voie / Hough; to accept the staff report, recommend Class 1 designation of the site with the condition that the ruins be preserved in its present decayed state. (6-0-1, Marsh absent.)

3. UNFINISHED BUSINESS: (None)

4. NEW BUSINESS:

4.A. CLARK PELLETT AND ROBERT KOHL REPRESENTING THE PSP1000 TRUST, OWNER, REQUESTING APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH A CLASS 3 HISTORIC SITE LOCATED AT 561 CAMINO NORTE, CASE 3.4088 MAA, ZONE R-1-A, (KL).

Staff Lyon summarized the staff report noting the board must affirmatively make both findings outlined in the ordinance for alterations to Class 3 sites in order to take action to re-classify to a higher level of historic designation.

Mark Rios, architect with Rios Clemente Studios spoke representing the owner. He further clarified the condition of the house and the chronology of alterations and additions noting that the house lacks historic integrity and does not convey significance as a design of Brewster & Benedict and no significant persons actually lived in the home.

Member La Voie asked if the owners had considered restoration of the house. (Mr. Rios noted no, only the living room has any interesting detail and less than 25% of the exterior of the original home exists.)

Member Hough stated she feels the association with interior designer Arthur Elrod is not significant or a good representation of Elrod's work.

Member Kiser agreed with Member Hough.

Member Hays stated he feels the house should not be demolished and the later non-contributing alterations could be removed and the original home could be restored and sympathetic additions could be proposed. He felt the Elrod alterations were significant as are the original architects.

Member Dixon felt the home reflects an impressive piece of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture.

Member La Voie feels the house in its current condition reflects the quirkiness and craftsman-like character of Spanish Colonial Revival, to look like it had been built over time. He opined that it is an amazing example of Spanish Colonial Revival architecture and that the style lends itself to appearing added onto over time.

Chair Burkett stated without the original plans or understanding of the exterior elevations it would be difficult to restore, but that non-contributing existing elements could be removed and other more sympathetic additions could be proposed.

Member La Voie opined that it is easily discernable by review of the exterior of the house that which is original and that which is an alteration.

Staff Lyon reminded the board of the two findings that must be made to warrant re-designation as a Class 1 or 2 resource.

M/S/C La Voie / Dixon; to reject the staff report and make findings that (1) the building possesses architectural significance as a Class 2 historic resource as an example of the Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style, but noting it does not have sufficient integrity to be Class 1, and is associated with the significant architectural firm Brewster & Benedict, and (2) that the building retains sufficient integrity relative to its original configuration to qualify as a Class 2 historic resource and (3) that a historic resource report be initiated to further study and document the condition of the home in support of these findings, (4) the later Arthur Elrod-designed alterations, while not entirely compatible with the original do not represent an addition that would not be approved by this board at this time. (5-1-1, Kiser opposed, Marsh absent.)

The applicant asked for clarification on the board's action.

Staff member Lyon summarized the board's action noting that the City would retain a consultant to do the historic resource study that the Board requested in their action.

The applicant asked the Board for clarification on which of the existing additions would be acceptable to be removed and those that were significant.

Member Dixon opined that the front portion of the living room was original and could be restored and other additions could be removed and rebuilt.

Member Hays noted everything shown in the exhibit of the floor plan that was an addition could be removed.

Member La Voie clarified his motion was to obtain a study of the house to determine those elements that are significant not to make that determination at this time.

The owner asked for greater clarification specifically of the components the board would want preserved. He asserted the house does not have sufficient integrity or significance to be re-classified.

Joe Roman, attorney for the owner, clarified that the board does not have authority to force an owner to restore the property.

Mark Rios reminded the board that there are no drawings of the original home and it would be impossible to actually accurately restore the exterior of the house, given that 75% of the exterior of the original home is gone.

Staff member Lyon stated that the applicant has a right to appeal the decision of the board to the City Council and that the request to initiate study of the home in the board's action would like be "held" until after the appeal period has concluded.

Member La Voie clarified the application was a request to demolish / alter a Class 3 site not a restoration. If the applicant desires to restore the home or submit a different scope, it would require a new or different application. (Lyon replied yes.)

The applicant clarified that the revised application was for substantial renovation.

Member Dixon asked if the board could withdraw its action and allow the applicant to withdraw the application and submit a revised application.

Staff Lyon explained under Roberts' Rules of Order a member who voted affirmatively on the action could move to reconsider the action.

The applicant requested a short recess to consider their options.

The board took a brief recess.

The board Chair reconvened the meeting at 11:15 am.

Staff Lyon reported that the applicant has accepted the board's last action and would not be requesting reconsideration.

4.B. STEVE BOUWMAN AND MICHAEL SILVAGGI, OWNERS, REQUESTING APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH A CLASS 4 HISTORIC SITE AT 863 NORTH AVENIDA PALOS VERDES, CASE 3.1421 MAA, ZONE R-1-B, APN 507-162-002-7, (KL).

Staff Lyon summarized the staff report.

Steve Bouwman, owner, further clarified the application noting that after study, they concluded that the home could not be effectively renovated and thus request demolition. He noted there were unpermitted structures in the north side yard setback of the site that also must be removed.

Member La Voie asked for clarification on that portion of the structure that was original.

Member Dixon asked whether there was any portion of the structure they considered to retain. (The applicant noted the original portion was considered but later rejected because it was not significant.)

Member La Voie opined that portions of the original structure were nice examples of Spanish Colonial Revival, but is not exceptional and that the structure does not qualify for re-classification to a higher level of historic designation.

Member Hays asked staff for clarification on the Board's options for action. (Staff Lyon clarified the two required findings the Board must make to take action to re-classify.)

Member Hough opined that the site did not warrant re-classification.

M/S/C La Voie / Hays to take no action (6-0-1, Marsh absent.)

4.C. EDDIE EDWARDS, ON BEHALF OF WCR HOLDINGS, LLC (DBA AVALON PAIN SOLUTIONS, INC.), OWNER, REQUESTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR ALTERATIONS TO "HARLOW HAVEN" (AKA "THE SOLANO COURT APARTMENTS"), A CLASS 1 HISTORIC SITE (HSPB #20), LOCATED AT 175 EAST EL ALAMEDA STREET (APN: 505-285-012) AND "THE VILLAGE INN HOTEL" (AKA "THE CRAWFORD APARTMENTS") A CLASS 3 HISTORIC SITE AND CONTRIBUTOR TO THE LAS PALMAS BUSINESS HISTORIC DISTRICT ("LPBHD"), LOCATED AT 855 NORTH INDIAN CANYON DRIVE, (APN 505-285-011), ZONE R-3, CASE 5.1472 CUP / 3.906 MAA / HSPB #20 / HD-1. (KL).

Staff Lyon summarized the staff report.

Member Dixon asked if the sign was proposed to be retained (Lyon replied no.)

Gary Cohn, architect for the owner further clarified the scope of the project.

Member La Voie asked about the inspiration for the stout columns. (Mr. Cohn noted there are stout engaged columns at Harlow Haven that were the architectural reference.) He recommended that the column capital capitals more closely emulate the Doric capitals at Harlow Haven and that the beams above them be thickened to appear credible on the stout columns. He suggested omission of the proposed window casing and that the walls at the stairs be stepped rather than sloped. He also suggested the bowed railing be revised to be straight vertical pickets.

Member Dixon stated the use and scope of the project was a good solution.

Member Hays stated his support for the project.

Chair Burkett stated his support for the project.

M/S/C Hays / Dixon accept the staff recommendation with the added conditions made by Mr. La Voie noting (1) the column capitals at the Crawford Hotel porch columns more closely emulate those at the pilasters at Harlow Haven, (2) the beams above the stout

columns proposed at the Crawford Apartments be thickened to appear credible on the stout columns, (3) that the window casing be omitted and instead, simple curved jams and head conditions be used, (4) that the wall at the stairs be stepped rather than sloped. (6-0-1, Marsh absent).

4.D. STEVEN G. BIGLEY, FOR THE BIGLEY FAMILY TRUST, OWNER REQUESTING APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH A CLASS 4 HISTORIC SITE LOCATED AT 111 EAST PALO VERDE AVENUE, 1100 & 1146 SOUTH PALM CANYON DRIVE, CASE 3.2161 MAA, ZONE C-1, (KL).

Staff Lyon noted that the applicant requested the application be continued to a date certain of the Board's May meeting.

M/S/C Dixon / Kiser to continue the item to a date certain of the May 14, 2019 HSPB meeting, (6-0-1 Marsh absent).

5. DISCUSSION:

5.A. 2019 SYMPOSIUM (Burkett, Kiser, Marsh).

Chair Burkett summarized the last round of preparations for the symposium, noting the event has roughly 375 registrants.

5.B LA PLAZA THEATER UPDATE (La Voie, Burkett, Marsh)

Staff Lyon summarized that the project under Councilmember J.R. Roberts leadership is moving into a fundraising stage.

5.C WELWOOD MURRAY LIBRARY COURTYARD RESTORATION STATUS (Johns, Burkett, Dixon)

Staff Lyon noted the City Council has approved additional funding for the design to be revised reflecting the last set of recommendations from the subcommittee and would likely return to the full board for Certificate of Appropriateness later this summer.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Member La Voie stressed that historic resource reports need to be unbiased.

STAFF COMMENTS: (none).

ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Site Preservation Board will adjourn to its regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, May 14, 2019, at 9:00 A.M, in the Large Conference Room at City Hall.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services