

HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

Large Conference Room, 3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way, Palm Springs, California 92262
www.palmspringsca.gov

MINUTES

October 8, 2019



9:00 AM
REGULAR MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

ROLL CALL: Chair Burkett, members Dixon, Nelson, Kiser

ABSENT: Members Hough, La Voie, Rosenow

2019 – Attendance Record for CLG

Name	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec
Dick Burkett	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Katherine Hough	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Bill La Voie	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jade Nelson	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Dan Kiser	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Linda Dixon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Erik Rosenow	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

M/S/C: Dixon / Nelson to accept the agenda with the deletion of the study session. (4-0-3, Hough, La Voie, Rosenow absent.)

PUBLIC COMMENT:

CHRIS MENRAD, representing the Palm Springs Modern Committee expressed concern regarding the processing of alterations to a single family residence at 423 Merito Place.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR: (none)

M/S/C: Dixon / Kiser to approve the minutes as presented (4-0-3, Hough, La Voie Rosenow absent).

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2.A. AN APPLICATION BY THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA FOR CLASS 1 HISTORIC RESOURCE DESIGNATION OF “THE THOMAS O’DONNELL GOLF HOUSE”, A PART OF THE O’DONNELL GOLF COURSE LOCATED AT 301 NORTH BELARDO ROAD, (APN# 513-070-009), CASE HSPB #123.

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

Member Dixon opined that entire golf course should be considered.

Member Nelson opined that the entire golf course, including the perimeter Tamarisk trees, should be considered.

Member Kiser opined that the entire golf course should be considered.

Chair Burkett noted the gate house is important and the Committee of 25’s activities therein.

Member Dixon asked about the preservation of the historic resource reports (they are digitally archived with the Planning Department).

The Chair opened the public hearing.

STEVEN KEYLON spoke on behalf of the PSPF and as author of the report. He believes the Tamarisk tree windbreak which pre-dates the golf course should also be a contributing element.

JAN HARPER, board of the PSPF and trustee of the O’Donnell Golf Club thanked the HSPB for consideration of the entire golf course.

ROB MOON, Mayor of Palm Springs, spoke in support of the nomination of the golf house and the entire golf course and associated buildings. The Mayor thanked the HSPB for its ongoing work.

Member Dixon thanked the Mayor and the City Council for their support of preservation efforts.

Chair Burkett thanked the Mayor for the recognition.

CHARLES BROBACK, member of board of directors of the O'Donnell Golf Club spoke in support of the entire golf course for possible historic designation.

The Chair closed the public hearing.

Member Nelson mentioned a request of staff of an aerial photo under the discussion of Setting and page 37 of the report noted the original barrel tile on the restroom building.

M/S/C Dixon / Nelson, to accept the recommendation in the staff report including the memo from Director Fagg to the HSPB identifying the various individual structures and their defining characteristics, to designate the entire golf course, all structures mentioned in Director Fagg's memo, and the landscape.

Member Nelson seconded the motion and amended the motion, to include all City-owned parcels that comprise the current golf course (shown on page 22 of the historic resources report and on the vicinity map in the nomination packet).

Member Dixon (maker of the motion) accepted the amendment.

Chair Burkett requested that the motion include a recommendation that the painted wood paneled ceilings be restored as a part of any future capital improvement project at the Golf House.

Staff Lyon clarified the interior public spaces of publicly owned buildings are subject to HSPB review.

Member Nelson inquired whether the later additions to the Gate House building should be included in character-defining elements. .

The Chair asked Mr. Keylon, author of the historic resource report, to clarify why he asserted the later additions were not contributing or character-defining. (Mr. Keylon clarified that if the Committee of 25 were to vacate the building and the City chose to restore the building, it should have the ability to do so, including removal of the later additions.)

Member Dixon requested staff to restate the motion: Staff member Lyon recapped the motion as follows: The motion is to recommend that the City Council consider Class 1 historic designation of the Golf House, the other associated buildings on the course as listed in the report, all City-owned parcels that comprise the golf course itself, including reference to the October 8, 2019 memo from Director Fagg noting the character-defining features of each element of the site, and that it includes a recommendation to restore the wood ceilings in the Golf House under a future capital improvement program for that building, that the Tamarisk trees be included in the inventory of the landscape

material that are contributing, that the later additions to the Gate House are not part of the character-defining features of that building.

The board then voted 4-0-3 (Hough, La Voie, Rosenow absent) to approve the above re-stated motion.

Director Fagg noted an inventory of the landscape material was recommended and the matter would be scheduled for a public hearing of the City Council at their October 23, 2019 meeting.

2.B. AN APPLICATION BY THE MERITO MANOR COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION FOR HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGNATION OF “MERITO MANOR” LOCATED AT 197 WEST MERITO PLACE (VARIOUS APN’S), CASE HSPB #121 / HD-8.

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

Member Nelson asked for clarification of how future boards might act upon alterations on non-contributing features such as the addition on unit 660 Belardo. (Staff Lyon noted it would follow procedures as outlined in the municipal code for alterations within a historic district.)

Member Dixon asked for clarification on the design guidelines.

Chair Burkett asked if there is a checklist of components for design guidelines. (Staff Lyon noted there are bulletins from the Secretary of the Interior for assisting groups in developing guidelines.) The Chair requested copy of the bulletins be shared with the Board and future Historic District applicants.

Member Nelson asked if the public sidewalk was part of the application (Staff Lyon stated it is likely in the public right-of-way and therefore not part of the nomination).

Member Nelson asked about unit 189, no owner is listed (Staff Lyon noted it is an absentee owner who was non-responsive to communications attempts made by the author of the historic resource report).

Chair Burkett noted the CC&R “design guidelines” lacked reference to the sliding patio doors (Staff Lyon stated this is an example why the condition of approval was included requiring the creation of concise design guidelines for the potential district).

The Chair opened the public hearing.

DOUG MACBETH, Merito Manor resident and author of the historic resource report further clarified the content of the historic resource report noting the Merito Manor property owners have worked several years on formulating and writing the nomination report.

Member Nelson further discussed the public sidewalks at the perimeter of the proposed district. Member Kiser clarified other locations where sidewalks occur in Old Las Palmas. (Staff Lyon clarified requirements for sidewalks are typical with new development from the City Engineering but can be “deferred to covenant”.)

Seeing no further speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Member Kiser commended the applicant on the report and initiation of the historic district application. He encouraged the HOA to consider a standard detail that could be used throughout the complex to conceal and screen roof-mounted mechanical equipment.

Chair Burkett recommended the mural at unit 660 be eliminated upon change of ownership of the unit. (Mr. MacBeth clarified the HOA has already imposed that condition on the future sale of the unit.)

M/S/C Nelson / Dixon to recommend designation by the City Council based on the findings in the staff report. (4-0-3, Hough, La Voie, Rosenow absent.)

2.C. AN APPLICATION THE DESERT HOLLY HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION FOR HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGNATION OF “THE DESERT HOLLY CONDOMINIUMS” LOCATED AT 2244 EAST TAHQUITZ CANYON WAY (VARIOUS APN’S), CASE HSPB #117 / HD-7. (KL).

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

Member Nelson inquired if there were photos that showed the common area of the report. (Lyon noted there were small photos in the report and narrative identifying the golf putting course and shuffleboard court and bench.)

The Chair opened the public hearing.

RON MARSHALL, of the Palm Springs Preservation Foundation spoke in support of the nomination. He noted the saguaro cacti that punctuate the roof plane at the eave of a couple of the units should be identified as character-defining. He noted the association has 6 of the 9 original flags from the putting course that used to exist in the development. He opined that the parking areas should be included in the list of contributing elements. He provided an exhibit clarifying the extent of original garden walls in the complex. He asked that the applicant be relieved of the requirement to develop design guidelines.

JIM HANLIN, resident of Desert Holly spoke in support of the nomination.

Seeing no further speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Member Nelson clarified that changes in the pavement at the bay parking would be something that would come before the board for review.

M/S/C Burkett / Dixon, to accept the staff report with the inclusion of the bay parking and parking lot in the list of contributing features as well as the exhibit showing the original site walls. (4-0-3, Hough, La Voie, Rosenow absent.)

3. UNFINISHED BUSINESS: (None)

4. NEW BUSINESS (None).

4.A. AN APPLICATION BY WILLIAM AND JENNIFER NELSON FAIN FOR CLASS 1 HISTORIC RESOURCE DESIGNATION OF THE J. CHENEY WELLS RESIDENCE, LOCATED AT ROCK 12 IN SMOKETREE RANCH, 1850 SMOKE TREE LANE. (KL).

M/S/C Burkett / Dixon to accept the report and direct staff to schedule site visits and a public hearing to consider the application.

5. DISCUSSION:

5.A. 2020 Symposium (Burkett).

Chair Burkett summarized the progress to date on planning for the 2020 symposium. The symposium dates April 18 and 19 with workshops on the second day.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Member Dixon inquired when the Inspiration Point nomination would be submitted to City Council for consideration. (Staff Lyon stated it would likely be after the November elections.)

Member Nelson asked for further clarification on the processing of the 423 Merito Place application. (Director Fagg noted it would be discussed under staff comments.)

Chair Burkett discussed an extracurricular tour of the College of the Desert campus in Palm Desert by architect Lance O'Donnell on October 25th (Friday) at 8:30 am. He asked about the Orchid Tree project (Director Fagg noted the current entitlements expire in November unless extended by the Planning Commission and that a new application has been submitted.)

Chair Burkett acknowledged Staff Member Lyon for his outreach efforts to various neighborhood organizations as an important component of community education on historic preservation and encouraged that outreach be done to the One PS organization.

He made suggestions on changes in the nomenclature of the various historic classifications (perhaps using "Landmark" and "Structure of Merit" in lieu of "Class 1" and "Class 2").

He mentioned a presentation by Melissa Richie of historic neighborhoods in Rancho Mirage at the Rancho Mirage library on October 15 at 2pm and November 10 on how to research your home's history.

Member Nelson inquired about construction work occurring on a mid-century apartment building on Camino Real (Twin Palms Apartments), and on the former bank building at 750 North Palm Canyon Drive.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Regarding the processing of the alterations to 423 Merito Place. Staff member Lyon passed out a brief synopsis of the City's processing of the application.

Director Fagg passed out a sheet showing the four categories of historic resources and the review body / authority (HSPB or HPO) for varying types of alterations.

Director Fagg explained the process of adding and subtracting properties from the Class 3 list using the industry standard "DPR forms" and review at a public meeting.

Lastly he explained there would be a review of the overall historic preservation ordinance near the end of the year to report to the City Council.

Chair Burkett questioned whether Staff Lyon was fully apprised of the 423 Merito project scope at the time of his review or whether the homeowner failed to divulge portions of the project at the early phase of review.

Member Nelson asked for clarification on the definition of and difference between major and minor alterations. (Staff Lyon explained and read the definitions from the ordinance.)

Chair Burkett asked for a study session at the November meeting to discuss Class 4 review criteria.

ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Site Preservation Board will adjourn to its regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, November 12, 2019, at 9:00 A.M, in the Large Conference Room at City Hall.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Director of Planning Services