



## SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION - REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, February 16, 2021

Pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20, by Governor Newsom, this meeting was conducted by teleconference and there was no in-person public access to the meeting location.

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chair Clark called the meeting to order at **5:33** p.m.

**ROLL CALL:** A quorum was present for this Regular Meeting of the City of Palm Springs Sustainability Commission.

### WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

**AGENDA APPROVAL:** The agenda was presented by Chair Clark. A motion to approve as posted was made by Commissioner Miller and seconded by Commissioner Baker and carried unanimously on an open vote.

	<u>This Meeting</u>	<u>Present to Date</u>	<u>FY 2020/2021 Excused Absences</u>	<u>FY 2020/2021 Unexcused Absences</u>
Roy Clark, Chair	X	49		
Robert McCann, Vice Chair	X	47		
David Freedman	X	59		
Jennifer Futterman	X	42	1	
Greg Gauthier	X	38	1	
Carl Baker	X	25		
Jim Flanagan	X	18		
Lani Miller	X	17		
Sandra Garratt	X	13	1	

X = Present

E = Excused (notified Chair and Staff of absence)

L = Late

U = did not notify of absence

**CITY STAFF PRESENT:** Patrick Tallarico, Manager, Office of Sustainability

**STAFF COMMENTS –** Manager Tallarico submitted a written report (which was included in the meeting materials) and added the following comment:

- In addition to the items included in the update memo, City Council approved the Agreement with Carbon Solutions Group to upgrade and expand of the EV Charging Infrastructure plan at the February 18, 2021 City Council meeting. Commissioner Freedman inquired about the funds generated under the agreement. Manager Tallarico confirmed the revenue from the lease rates received from Carbon Solutions Group would be attributed to the Sustainability account.

### PUBLIC COMMENTS

- Commissioner Miller announced the Sierra Club has a commitment on greenhouse gases and that they are looking to collaborate with local government agencies.
- A community member inquired if there was a plan for residential composting. That topic was addressed later in the agenda.

### A. PRESENTATIONS – None

### B. MEETING MINUTES

January 19, 2021, Regular Meeting minutes approval: Motion by Vice Chair McCann to accept as modified, second by Commissioner Miller. Motion passed unanimously on an open vote.

### C. OLD BUSINESS

1. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory – Manager Tallarico
  - Manager Tallarico shared the highlights from the Greenhouse Gas Inventory Report Updates

provided by the consultant PlaceWorks. PlaceWorks was asked to review the 2010 data set for comparison to the 2019 update. The most significant update to the 2010 data was the change to vehicle miles traveled. Additional updates which had less significant impact were:

- Emission factors for vehicles now reflects the mix of vehicle types in Coachella Valley.
- Changes to allocation of off-road equipment emissions.
- Removal of GHG emissions from some ozone-depleting substance substitutions.
- Addition of carbon sequestration from natural lands and street trees.

The overall impact to the 2010 data is an increase of 35% more emissions due to the transportation emissions. Manager Tallarico shared that the overall comparison between the 2010 data and the 2018 data was only an increase of 1% in emissions. Overall, transportation was the largest contributor to community-wide emissions in both years, followed by residential and commercial energy use. Manager Tallarico will follow up with PlaceWorks about adjusting the original baseline.

2. Smoking Ordinance and Restrictions for Outdoor Dining – Commissioner Baker

- Commissioner Baker provided an update on the draft Ordinance to Amend the Municipal Code for Clean Indoor Air and Health Protection to Regulate Tobacco and Cannabis Product Use.
- The Commission worked on a draft Ordinance over the past two years. The Human Rights Commission also developed a draft.
- Discussions centered on the rights of residents in Multi Family Dwellings. The current language excluding them from smoking inside of their residence and it may be perceived as unfair for residents that can afford to live in a detached home to smoke while those in multi-family dwellings cannot.
- Manager Tallarico discussed the request that the Commission had received from City Council to conduct town halls to get public input on this ordinance and explore some of the more difficult issues.
- MOTION: The Sustainability Commission should approve that the draft Ordinance to Amend the Municipal Code for Clean Indoor Air and Health Protection to Regulate Tobacco and Cannabis Product Use be forwarded to City Council.
- The Motion was put forward by Commissioner Miller, seconded by Commissioner Baker. The Motion failed with four (4) “aye” votes from Chair Clark, Vice Chair McCann, Commissioner Baker and Commissioner Miller and five (5) “no” votes from Commissioners Flanagan, Freedman, Futterman, Garratt and Gauthier.
- Commissioner Baker will report the discussion back to the Human Rights Commission and collaborate on edits.

3. Fees at Baristo Parking Structure, Policy Statement – Commissioner Flanagan

- Commissioner Flanagan reviewed the proposed edits to the comments on the proposed parking fee language for the General Plan update. Suggested edits are:
  - In the first paragraph: “such as walking, bicycles, public transportation and ride share.
  - Under the first paragraph add: (Replaces Policy Statement CR.8.11)
  - Under Action: Create a plan to identify parking availability in the downtown core and proximity to restaurants and merchants and the best locations to implement fee-based parking.
  - Add: (Replaces Action Statement CR.8.1)
- MOTION: The Sustainability Commission should approve that the Proposed Fee-based Parking Language for the General Plan be recommended to the General Plan Steering Committee.
- The Motion was put forward by Commissioner Freedman to accept with edits, seconded by Commissioner Flanagan. The Motion passed with seven (7) “aye” votes from Chair Clark, Vice Chair McCann and Commissioners Flanagan, Freedman, Futterman, Garratt and Miller and two (2) “no” votes from Commissioners Baker and Gauthier.

4. Sustainability Scholarship and Home Energy Assessment Status and Feedback – Manager Tallarico

- Manager Tallarico provided an update with approximately \$22,000 currently reserved for payment from the Sustainability funds and \$5,000 currently reserved for payment from the Recycling funds. Manager Tallarico also shared that radio ads on local Spanish speaking radio channels recently began airing to increase outreach efforts to gardeners to encourage electric leaf blower purchases.
- Manager Tallarico asked for the Commission’s approval or denial for a request for an energy efficient pool pump application. The Commission approved the request.
- Manager Tallarico asked for the Commissioners approval or denial for a request for applications from two business owners that have multiple properties and have submitted applications for multiple

scholarships. The Commission approved the request and confirmed that awards should be made based on the business license, not the ownership.

#### **D. NEW BUSINESS**

##### **1. Tree Standards and Arbor Day - Manager Tallarico**

- Manager Tallarico provided information on the Tree City USA Standards. The Commissioners asked if a ceremony could be planned for Arbor Day to celebrate the new trees being planted by the City as a result of a recent grant. Manager Tallarico will discuss the Tree City criteria and the tree planting with the City Maintenance Department and report back to the Commission at the next meeting.

#### **E. SUBCOMMITTEE AND COMMISSIONER REPORTS**

##### **1. Standing Subcommittee on Solar and Green Building - Commissioner Freedman reported**

- Commissioner Freedman reported on updates from the California Energy Commission and Public Utilities Commission Proceedings and that it is unlikely there will be an all-electric baseline in the future.
- The implementation of AB 1236 for the Streamlined EV Charger Installation was approved by City Council and is now in effect.
- The American Wind Energy Association selected Palm Springs for a Wind Energy Success Story. Manager Tallarico will be collecting information for that writeup.

##### **2. Standing Subcommittee on Waste Reduction – Manager Tallarico reported**

- Manager Tallarico reported that a community member is interested in starting a community composting program which could sustain 1,000 pounds per week. There is space at the community garden, which could sustain a community composting area. The program would need to be run by volunteers. More to follow on this topic at a future meeting.
- SB 1383 begins on January 1, 2022, which is a state requirement for composting for residential and commercial customers.
- Commissioner Freedman inquired about City Council's current position on the single-use plastic food ware ordinance. Manager Tallarico stated that Council requested that this be brought back to Council in March, although he noted that the City's main priority must be Organics Management to meet the State mandated SB 1383.
- Manager Tallarico provided an overview of the Analytical Roadmap for the Wastewater Treatment Plant Improvements for Organics Treatment and Biogas Management. The topic will continue to be addressed at the Subcommittee level.

##### **3. Standing Subcommittee on World Environment Day – Commissioner Futterman reported**

- Commissioner Futterman provided an update on the launch of an art contest and submission of information to Riverside County.
- Manager Tallarico requested Commissioner Futterman obtain a formal request for sponsorship and provide that to the City. Commissioner Futterman would like a press release written, distributed and for the information on the event to be shared on social media.

##### **4. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Walkability & Pedestrian Planning - Manager Tallarico reported**

- Manager Tallarico provided a report and overview.
- Virtual walk audits will be completed with the consultant in March 2021 and will be completed by district with areas of concern identified within each district.

##### **5. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Bicycle Routes and Cycling – Commissioner Flanagan reported**

- Commissioner Flanagan provided an overview of a proposal for a bike lane on Palm Canyon Drive and will have additional updates at the March 16, 2021 meeting.

##### **6. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Night Sky – Vice Chair McCann reported**

- Vice Chair McCann requested the Commissioners read through the White Paper and be ready to discuss the information at the March 16, 2021 meeting.

##### **7. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Strategic Planning and General Plan Update**

- No report.

##### **8. Water Conservation – Commissioner Freedman reported**

- Commissioner Freedman reported that he followed up with DWA on the bill comparison and the comparison was based on meter size.

- DWA achieved a 5% reduction in January 2021.
- Water conservation remains very important.

9. Wellness

- No report.

10. Desert Community Energy, Community Advisory Committee – Commissioners Freedman reported

- Commissioner Freedman attended the February 9, 2021, signing ceremony for the new wind power projects that will be included in the DCE energy portfolio. The Mayor, Council members Kors and Middleton were also present.

**F. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND UPCOMING AGENDA**

- Chair Clark requested Connect IE be placed on the March 16, 2021 agenda. Commissioner Baker will present.
- Commissioner Garratt provided a brief update on the funding of the Salton Sea restoration project and would like to have future discussions on how Palm Springs can provide support to this project. She agreed to provide links to information to City staff for distribution.

**G. ADJOURNMENT** - The meeting of the Sustainability Commission adjourned at **7:44** p.m. by a motion from Commissioner Flanagan and seconded by Commissioner Garratt and approved by a unanimous vote. They adjourned to the Regular Meeting of the Sustainability Commission to be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, March 16, 2021, location to be determined. There is a possibility that the next meeting will be via telecommunication also. The Sustainability Commission's regular meeting schedule is at 5:30 p.m. the third Tuesday each month except August unless otherwise noted or amended.

Respectfully Submitted,

Patrick Tallarico, Manager, Office of Sustainability