

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

www.palmspringsca.gov

AGENDA

Monday
October 11, 2021



5:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

Mission Statement

Palm Springs is an inclusive world-class city dedicated to providing excellent and responsive public services to enhance the quality of life for current and future generations.

Pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20, this meeting will be conducted by teleconference and there will be no in-person public access to the meeting location.

- To view/listen/participate in the meeting live, please use the following link:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/83240168315?pwd=U0VRbWtqbkJSS3pvRHFOQWFGBDhIdz09>

or call (669) 900-6833 **Zoom Meeting ID** 832 4016 8315, **Passcode** 677117

- Written public comment may also be submitted to cityclerk@palmspringsca.gov. Transmittal prior to the meeting is required. Any correspondence received during or after the meeting will be distributed to the Board/Commission as soon as practicable and retained for the official record.
- The meeting will be recorded and the audio file will be available from the Office of the City Clerk and will be posted on the City's YouTube channel, as soon as practicable.

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chair Ron deHarte
2. **ROLL CALL:** Board Members: Hugo Loyola, David Vignolo, Oliver Cleary, Kalina Robles, Terrie Andrade, Glenn Flood, Edwin Ramoran, Vice Chair Donna Shepherd, and Chair Ron deHarte

Student Representative Lilly Hanner

3. **MISSION STATEMENT & GOALS:**

"The Mission of the Palm Springs Human Rights Commission is to promote and protect the diversity of our community and to improve human relations through education and community awareness."

Human Rights Commission Goals:

- *To develop community education programs;*
- *To investigate and mediate instances of discrimination of groups or individuals;*
- *To bring persons and groups together in common support of human rights issues;*
- *To acquire the fiscal and human resources necessary to support and accomplish the work of the Commission;*
- *To provide management and coordination for the Commission;*
- *To promote diversity through the appointment of candidates to all city boards and commissions to proportionately reflect the diversity of the population of the City of Palm Springs;*
- *The Commission and each Committee shall develop goals and objectives annually, for adoption by the commission;*
- *The Commission shall work closely with the Mayor, City Council, and City Cabinet and with all other City Commissions and Boards in joint endeavors that support the Commission's mission statement and City's goals and objectives.*

4. QUORUM:

5. PUBLIC COMMENTS: This time has been set aside for members of the public to address the Human Rights Commission on agenda items; and items of general interest within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. Three (3) minutes is allowed for each speaker. Although the Commission values your comments, pursuant to the Brown Act, it generally cannot take any action on items not listed on the posted agenda. Commissioners will not enter into discussion with speakers, but during Commission Comments, may refer the matter to staff for report and recommendation at a future Commission meeting.

6. CHAIR COMMENTS:

7. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 13, 2021

8. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION/ACTION:

A. Reports

Executive Report Standing Committee (Chair deHarte, Vice Chair Shepherd)

a. Retreat

Community Relations /Budget/Personnel Report

- a. PSPD LGBT Outreach Liaison (deHarte)
- b. Master Calendar Liaison (Ramoran)
- c. Main Street Liaison (deHarte)
- d. Organized Neighborhoods of Palm Springs Liaison (Vignolo)

Cultural Affairs Report

Desert Highland Gateway Estates Community Association Liaison (Andrade, Flood, Shepherd)

Seniors/People with Disabilities Veterans Affairs Report

- a. Veterans Issues Liaison (Flood,Vignolo)

Youth/Education Affairs Standing Committee

- a. Student Representatives (Hanner, Robles, Shepherd, Vignolo)

Commission Development/Mediation Report

- a. Mediation Liaison (Andrade, Vignolo)

B. Ad Hoc Committee - Clean Indoor Air and Health Protection Draft Ordinance with Sustainability Commission Update (Ramoran)

C. Homelessness Update

D. Vision and Priorities Update

- a. Priorities/Areas of Focus for the City Council Visioning Session

E. Commissioner, Staff, and Student Comments

F. Topical Newsworthy Items

9. AGENDA ITEMS FOR THE NEXT HRC MEETING:

10. ANNOUNCEMENTS:

11. ADJOURNMENT: The Commission will adjourn to an adjourned regular meeting Monday, November 8, 2021.

PUBLIC NOTICES

Pursuant to G.C. Section 54957.5(b)(2) the designated office for inspection of records in connection with the meeting is the Office of the City Clerk, City Hall, 3200 E. Tahquitz Canyon Way.

It is the intention of the City of Palm Springs to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) in all respects. If, as an attendee or a participant at this meeting, or in meetings on a regular basis, you will need special assistance beyond what is normally provided, the City will attempt to accommodate you in every reasonable manner. Please contact the Office of the City Clerk, (760) 323-8204, at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to inform us of your particular needs and to determine if accommodation is feasible.

AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING

I, Jay Virata, Director of Community & Economic Development, of the City of Palm Springs, California, hereby certify this Agenda was posted at City Hall before 6:00 p.m., October 7, 2021, and posted on the City’s website as required by established policies and procedures.

/S/ Jay Virata
Jay Virata
Community & Economic Development

**Human Rights Commission
CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA**



FOR APPROVAL

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting**

Monday, September 13, 2021
Virtual Zoom Meeting

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chair deHarte called the meeting was called to order at 5:31PM.
2. **ROLL CALL:**

Present: Commissioners Andrade, deHarte, Flood, Loyola, Ramoran, Robles, Shepherd, Vignolo Student Representatives Cash and Hanner

Absent: Andrade, Cleary

Staff Present: City Attorney Jeff Ballinger, and Jay Virata, Director, Community & Economic Development
3. **MISSION STATEMENT & GOALS:**
4. **QUORUM:** YES.
5. **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**
6. **CHAIR COMMENTS:**
 - A. Recognition of Service
 - Recognition was presented to former Vice-Chair Denise Chappell for her six years of dedication and service to the Palm Springs Human Rights Commission. A plaque of recognition was mailed to her prior to today's meeting. Denise was unable to be present for the meeting due to illness but relayed that she would proudly hang it on her office wall.
 - B. Standing Committee Meeting Notice Requirement
 - Director Virata announced that it was brought to his attention that the Human Rights Commission committees are legislative bodies and are required to abide by the Brown Act in terms of public meetings and public notices. City Attorney Jeff Ballinger was introduced to provide the Commission with some options and alternatives to consider in terms of meeting notices and the structure of the Commission.
 - City Attorney Ballinger presented information on the Brown Act with regards to Standing Committees, and AdHoc committees. The Human Rights Commission is a legislative body under the Brown Act; therefore, meetings require notices and public access. Standing Committees of a legislative body are themselves a legislative body because they have long term or perpetual jurisdiction over something. Ad Hoc committees are not subject to the notice and posting requirements of the Brown Act. They are created for a short time period, have only members of the Commission but less than a quorum and only makes recommendations. It was identified by going through minutes and notes that the Commission has a number of standing committees. If the Commission, continues with the current committee structure, they will be subject to the Brown Act, requiring public access to meetings and posting of Agenda notices. Additional options was shared with the Commission on how they can have Commissioners involved in things, such as recognizing one or two Commissioners as Liaisons who have a particular expertise or interest on an issue and serve as Liaison to Staff or the Public. The Commission is able to have a combination of Standing, Adhoc and Liaisons. It was

highlighted that just recognizing that having standing committees does create some obligations on a part of staff with having to make sure the Agenda is posted, and meetings are made public. City Attorney Ballinger responded to Commissioner questions.

- There was consensus among the Commission to discuss the step they want to take with each committee during Agenda item 9.

7. RECOGNITION

A. Hispanic Heritage Month – Celebrated September 15 to October 15

- Commissioner Loyola presented the Hispanic Heritage Month Proclamation.
- **MOTION BY:** COMMISSIONER LOYOLA, SECOND BY VICE CHAIR SHEPHERD TO HAVE THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION ADOPT THE RESOLUTION AND HAVE THE PROCLAMATION READ ON SEPTEMBER 15.
- **DISCUSSION:**
 - Commissioner Vignolo asked if the Commission can adopt the resolution if the third paragraph from the end reads ‘ the undersigned members of the Palm Springs City Council’
 - Director Virata indicated the City Council might have adopted the proclamation at the September 9, 2021 City Council Meeting.
 - Amendment to the motion was made: If the City Council has not adopted the resolution the Commission substitutes in the resolution where it says City Council to say the Palm Springs Human Rights Commission and make that change in both instances where it references City Council; and, no change will be required if City Council adopted the resolution at their September 9, 2021 meeting
 - Amendment and changes accepted by the motion made by Commissioner Loyola and Shepherd
 - MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- **MOTION BY:** VICE CHAIR SHEPHERD, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER LOYOLA TO PRESENT THE PROCLAMATION WITH COMMUNITY LEADERS FROM THE HISPANIC LATINO COMMUNITIES AT 5:30PM ON SEPTEMBER 15, 2021 VIA ZOOM WITH COUNCILMEMBER GARNER. **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B. International Day for the Eradication of Poverty

- Student Representative Cash gave a presentation observing and promoting awareness of October 17 – International Day for the Eradication of Poverty.

8. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: JULY 12, 2021

- **MOTION BY:** Commissioner Flood, Second by Commissioner Robles to accept the minutes as presented.
- **DISCUSSION:**
- Commissioner Vignolo identified corrections on agenda item 11.E. referencing bullet #3 and #4 where his name was referenced.
- Chair DeHart in response to Commissioner Vignolo, suggested striking as erroneous entry; Commissioner Vignolo agreed.
- **MOTION RESTATED:** MOTION BY: Commissioner Flood, second by Commissioner Robles to adopt the minutes with the corrections noted by Commissioner Vignolo and Chair deHarte to Director Virata. **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

9. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION/ACTION:

A. Committees – Chair deHarte and Vice Chair Shepherd, Loyola

- Chair deHarte stated the Commission will go through line by line and decide how they shift from Standing Committee to a different form of reporting back to the Commission.
- The Commission proceeded with reviewing and discussing each committee report/assignments. Final consensus is identified next to each line as either **Standing Committee, Ad Hoc, or Appoint as Liaison:**

Executive Committee (deHarte, Shepherd) – **Remain as a Standing Committee.**

Community Relations Committee/Budget/Personnel Committee

- a. PSPD LGBT Outreach Committee (deHarte) – **Appoint as Liaison.**
- b. Master Calendar (Ramoran) – **Appoint as Liaison.**
- c. Main Street (deHarte) – **Appoint as Liaison.**
- d. Finance (Vignolo) - **Commission consensus to dissolve the Finance Committee. Finance returns to the entire Commission.**
- e. Organized Neighborhoods of Palm Springs (Vignolo) – **Appoint as Liaison.**

Cultural Affairs Committee

- a. Desert Highland Gateway Estates Community Association (Andrade, Flood, Shepherd) – **Appoint as Liaison.**

Seniors/People with Disabilities Veterans Affairs Committee

- a. Veterans' issues (Flood, Vignolo) – **Appoint as Liaison.**

Youth/Education Affairs Committee

- a. Student Representatives (Shepherd, Cash, Hanner) - **Commission consensus to remain as a Standing Committee, expand membership.**

Commission Development/Mediation Committee

- a. Mediation (Andrade) – **Appoint as Liaison.**
- b. Retreat (Shepherd, deHarte) – **Commission consensus to shift Retreat under Executive Committee which is seen as a standing Committee.**

B. Committee Assignments

- a. Clean Indoor Air and Health Protection Draft Ordinance with Sustainability Commission Update (Ramoran) - **Remain as Ad-Hoc Committee.**
- b. Street naming update (Ramoran, Shepherd) - **Remain as Ad-Hoc Committee.**

MOTION REGARDING COMMITTEES:

- Chair deHarte entertained motions for the following: To no longer hold standing committees for the Community Relations/Budget/Personnel Committee, Cultural Affairs Committee, Seniors/People with Disabilities Veterans Affairs Committee and Commission Development/Mediation Committee. Move responsibilities for Retreat planning and organization to the Executive Committee. Appoint Commissioner Robles, and formally appoint Vice Chair Shepherd to serve on the Youth Education Affairs Standing Committee.
- Commissioner comments and questions ensued regarding the Youth Education Affairs Standing Committee. Commission consensus to appoint Commissioner Vignolo to serve on the Youth/Education Affairs Committee with Commissioner Robles and Vice Chair Shepherd. Student Representative Cash announced that today will be her last meeting she will attending because she is moving to Los Angeles. Chair deHarte indicated that they still need to entertain a motion by the Commission.
- **MOTION BY:** Commissioner Vignolo, Second by Commissioner Flood, to adopt ending the following standing committees: Community Relations/Budget/Personnel Committee, Cultural Affairs Committee, Seniors/People with Disabilities Veterans Affairs Committee and Commission Development/Mediation Committee. Responsibilities of Retreat planning and development shall be assigned to the Executive Committee; and Appointing Commissioners Robles, Vignolo and Vice Chair Shepherd shall serve on the Youth Education Affairs Standing Committee. **MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. CONSIDERATION OF SUBMITTING PRIORITIES/AREAS OF FOCUS FOR THE CITY COUNCIL VISIONING SESSION

- Chair deHarte introduced the City Council Priority Matrix. A collaborative discussion followed among Commissioners, Student Representatives and Staff Liaison about important topics they each identified as ongoing priorities/areas and new priorities/areas of focus. The Matrix is due mid-October to City Manager Justin Clifton. Commission consensus to only identify one (1) ongoing priority and one (1) new priority. No action taken. Executive Committee to summarize all comments shared from today's meeting and circulated to the Commission at an agenda meeting. Commissioners were invited to contribute additional comments on ongoing and new priorities by emailing Director Virata a completed City Council Priority Matrix, which will be then forwarded to the Executive Committee.

D. COMMISSIONER, STAFF AND STUDENT COMMENTS:

- Chair deHarte thanked Student Representative Cash for her contributions during her service and wished her well at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA)
- Commissioner Shepherd is very glad to hear Director Virata's great perspective and input.
- Commissioner Ramoran thanked Student Representative Cash and reported on upcoming events as the Master Calendar Liaison: Election Day – September 14, Hispanic Heritage Month Reading Challenge at the Palm Springs Library –September 15 to October 15, Indigenous Peoples Day-October 11, Filipino American History Month – October, Larry Itliong Day – October 25, Palm Springs Pride Parade- November 7, Veterans Day Parade – November 11; thankful the war in Afghanistan is over.
- Commissioner Vignolo inquired on the process and if it would be appropriate for the Commission to extend their congratulations to Mayor Pro Tem Middleton on her appointment to the Historic California Transgender Advisory Council for the State of California.
- Chair deHarte, on behalf of the Commission, will send Mayor Pro Tem Middleton a direct email congratulating her on her appointment to the Historic California Transgender Advisory Council for the State of California.

E. Topical Newsworthy Items –

Chair deHarte reminded everyone to watch for the meeting notice to go out for the Special Proclamation Presentation on September 15, 2021 at 5:30. Everyone is welcome to attend and dial in.

- 12. AGENDA ITEMS FOR THE NEXT HRC MEETING:** The following items were proposed for the next Agenda:
- Clean Indoor Air and Health Protection Draft Ordinance with Sustainability Commission Update
- 13. ANNOUNCEMENTS:** NONE.
- 14. ADJOURNMENT:** The Commission adjourned at 7:52 PM to an adjourned special joint meeting with the Palm Springs City Council on Wednesday, September 29, 2021 at 5:30 PM via teleconference.

Respectfully submitted,

Annie Rodriguez
Housing Program Assistant