

HISTORIC SITE PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, CALIFORNIA

Pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20 this meeting was conducted by teleconference and there was no in-person public access to the meeting location.

www.palmspringsca.gov

MINUTES

Tuesday,
November 2, 2021



5:30 PM
REGULAR MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: The Chair called the meeting to order at 5:31 PM

ROLL CALL: Chair Hough, Vice-Chair Nelson, Rosenow, Kiser, Rose, Miller.

ABSENT: Hansen (Excused)

STAFF PRESENT: Development Services Director, Flinn Fagg, AICP Historic Preservation Officer / Principal Planner Ken Lyon, RA, City Attorney, Jim Priest.

REPORT OF THE POSTING OF AGENDA: The agenda for this meeting was posted for public review at the City Hall bulletin board (west side of Council Chamber) and the Planning Department counter by 6:00 P.M. on Thursday, October 28, 2021, as required by established policies and procedures.

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA:

Motion by Miller, seconded by Rose, to accept the agenda as presented.

AYES: Rose, Miller, Hough, Nelson, Kiser, Rosenow.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: Hansen

PUBLIC COMMENT:

The following individuals spoke opposing item 4.A., (the proposed removal of the Bogert statue from the City Hall site): SUSAN SECOYJENSEN, MARK BRAGG, CARRIE ALLEN, SUE LEFEVRE, RENEE BROWN, DOUG EVANS, NORM KING, MARK TEMPLE, DAVID CHRISTIAN, BETSY CECCANTI, NEGIE BOGERT, SUSAN SMITH AND DOTTIE WILDER.

There were no others wishing to address the Board and Chair Hough closed public comments.

1. CONSENT CALENDAR:

1.A. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: HSPB MEETINGS OF AUGUST 26, 2021, SEPTEMBER 14, 2021, AND SEPTEMBER 29, 2021.

Regarding the minutes of August 26, 2021, Miller noted that Chair Hough was absent, and Vice-Chair Nelson led the meeting.

In reference to the minutes of September 29, 2021, Page 2, Vice-Chair Nelson requested that the record reflect that his suggested amendment included a site for the mural to be relocated at a future date.

Motion by Rosenow, seconded by Miller, to approve the minutes of the HSPB meetings of August 26, 2021, September 14, 2021, and September 29, 2021, as corrected.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Nelson, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: Hansen

2. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

2.A. AN APPLICATION BY JOSEPH MANTELLO AND PAUL MARLOW, OWNERS, FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF "THE DONALD WEXLER RESIDENCE", LOCATED AT 1272 EAST VERBENA DRIVE (HSPB #139) (KL)

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

Seeing no questions of staff, Chair Hough opened the public hearing.

STEVEN KEYLON, representing the owners, spoke in support of the project.

Seeing no other speakers, Chair Hough closed the public hearing.

Members of the Board commented positively on the report and the project.

Motion by Rose, seconded by Rosenow, to adopt the findings in the staff report and recommend Class 1 historic site designation by the City Council.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Nelson, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: Hansen

3. UNFINISHED BUSINESS: (None.)

4. NEW BUSINESS:

4.A. THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS, REQUESTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR ALTERATIONS TO THE PALM SPRINGS CITY HALL, A CLASS 1 (LANDMARK) HISTORIC SITE, LOCATED AT 3200 EAST TAHQUITZ CANYON WAY, (HSPB #33D / CASE 3.3377). (KL).

Attorney Priest acknowledged public comments on this item; noted the Board is only deciding on the removal of the Bogert statue from City Hall and must make certain findings before issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Staff member Lyon summarized staff report.

Chair Hough discussed the sculpture; referenced the Visual Arts Rights Act (VARA) of 1990 and opined that if the sculpture is removed, it may change the integrity of the artwork as it was the artist's intention to place the artwork on a cropping of rocks. She addressed the importance of protecting artistic property and ensure public access and noted the piece is part of the City's public art collection.

Attorney Priest reported that his office has looked into the issue of the Visual Arts Rights Act of 1990 and believed that if the statue is carefully removed and stored, it would still meet the requirements of VARA; there would be no defacement, alteration or mutilation of the statue.

Vice-Chair Nelson disclosed his mother knew Frank Bogert and worked with the Palm Springs Historical Society to design a second edition of his book; expressed concerns that the HSPB is being asked to opine on a highly politicized issue and felt it would be logical for the Art Commission to make any determination on the resolution or replacement of statues and declared his abstention on this matter.

Board Member Rosenow spoke about the need for more a clear CEQA determination, did not feel this should fall under the Class 31 exemption.

Board Member Rose expressed concerns the Board may be acting on an incomplete record; and stated a decision cannot be made without a complete record.

Board Member Kiser stated the proposed removal of the statue might be less controversial if the action also included clarification on its relocation or storage.

Board Member Miller acknowledged the contributions of Mr. Bogert; and spoke about the Board's task. He stated he sees nothing that tells him the removal of the statue would adversely affect the historical resource of City Hall.

Staff member Lyon referenced the staff report noting the statue itself is not a designated historical resource and reiterated the question is whether the removal of the statue would materially impair the historic resource that is the City Hall and its site.

Motion by Rose, seconded by Rosenow, to continue the matter to a date certain of December 7, 2021, and direct staff to initiate a historic resources (assessment) report to provide further information about the historic significance of the City Hall site and the Bogert statue.

AYES: Rose, Rosenow, Kiser Hough.
NOES: Miller.
ABSTAIN: Nelson.
ABSENT: Hansen.

4.B. REVIEW FOR POTENTIAL RE-DESIGNATION OF A CLASS 4 SITE TO A CLASS 1 OR 2 HISTORIC RESOURCE INITIATED BY AN APPLICATION BY MARK W. DANIELS, OWNER REQUESTING APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH THE DWELLING LOCATED AT 217 EAST OCOTILLO AVENUE (APN 508-301-009), CASE 3.4288 MAA (KL).

Vice-Chair Nelson announced he wrote the historic resources assessment for the applicant on this item; declared a conflict of interest, recused himself from the item and left the meeting.

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

SEAN HARRIS, representing the owner, offered to respond to questions from the Board.

Motion by Rosenow, seconded by Miller, to accept the recommendation in the staff report and take no action allowing the demolition permit to be processed.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: Hansen
RECUSED: Nelson

Vice-Chair Nelson returned to the meeting.

4.C. REVIEW FOR POTENTIAL RE-DESIGNATION OF A CLASS 4 SITE TO A CLASS 1 OR 2 HISTORIC RESOURCE INITIATED BY AN APPLICATION BY DON GOTTFELD, OWNER REQUESTING APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH THE DWELLING LOCATED AT 1057 EAST BUENA VISTA DRIVE, (APN 507-223-003) CASE 3.4292 MAA (KL).

Staff member Lyon summarized the staff report.

DON GOTTFELD, owner, offered to respond to questions from the Board.

Vice-Chair Nelson noted one of the earliest owners of the home was Mr. John Hollinger, and listed his accomplishments.

Motion by Miller, seconded by Kiser, to accept the recommendation in the staff report and take no action allowing the demolition permit to be processed.

AYES: Miller, Nelson Rose, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: Hansen

4.D. APPLICATION BY CHARLES AND PATRICIA STUMPF, OWNERS, FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE WILLIAM PURCELL RESIDENCE, LOCATED AT 252 EAST OCOTILLO AVENUE (HSPB #141) (KL).

Motion by Rosenow, seconded by Rose, to receive the historic resources report and direct staff to schedule site visits for the Board to visit the property and then schedule a public hearing to consider the application.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough, Nelson.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: Hansen

4.E. AN APPLICATION BY THE CITY OF PALM SPRINGS FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF “EL DUMPO ADOBE” (HSPB #128) LOCATED AT 2276 SOUTH ARABY DRIVE AND “THE ARABY ROCK HOUSES” (HSPB #129) LOCATED AT 2350, 2500, 2501, 2540 AND 2550 SOUTH ARABY DRIVE. (KL).

Motion by Miller, seconded by Nelson, to receive the report and direct staff to schedule site visits for the Board to visit the property and then schedule a public hearing to consider the application.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough, Nelson.

NOES: None.

ABSENT: Hansen

5. DISCUSSIONS:

5.A. ANNUAL WORK PROGRAM (KL)

Staff member Lyon, RA summarized the staff report.

Vice-Chair Nelson asked about the Gas Company building and potential for adverse changes being made to the site.

Staff member Lyon noted the recent ordinance revisions put in place procedural safeguards.

Development Services Director Flinn Fagg reported he has met with the owner of the Gas Company building to encourage him to pursue designation of the site.

Motion by Rose, seconded by Miller, to accept the 21/22 HSPB Work Plan as follows:

1. Gas Company
2. Stephen Willard / Moorten Residence.
3. Kaptur designed Tahquitz Golf Course Clubhouse
4. Saks Building.
5. Courthouse Building.

Along with the education and outreach initiatives previously noted.

AYES: Miller, Rose, Kiser, Rosenow, Hough, Nelson.
NOES: None.
ABSENT: Hansen

5.B. ANNUAL PRESERVATION MATTERS SYMPOSIUM (Hough, Kiser, Nelson)

Chair Hough provided a brief update of recent subcommittee meetings.

Board Member Kiser noted that holding the party event on Sunday evening rather than on the first evening would likely draw better attendance at day 2 of the event.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS:

Vice-Chair Nelson thanked community members for their public comment.

STAFF COMMENTS:

Staff member Lyon noted the owners of the Racquet Club have submitted a demolition plan for the non-designated buildings for Council approval.

He acknowledged the opening of the City's new downtown park; thanked Will Kleindienst and the Palm Springs Preservation Foundation for their involvement in the historic marker at the site.

He noted a Certificate of Appropriateness application had been received from the Bank of America regarding the City National Bank building.

ADJOURNMENT: The Historic Site Preservation Board adjourned at 7:37 PM to its regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, December 7, 2021, at 5:30 PM.

Flinn Fagg, AICP
Development Services Director