



SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION - REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, December 21, 2021

Pursuant to Assembly Bill 361, by Governor Newsom, this meeting was conducted by teleconference and there was no in-person public access to the meeting location.

CALL TO ORDER: Chair Clark called the meeting to order at **5:31** p.m.

ROLL CALL: A quorum was present for this Regular Meeting of the City of Palm Springs Sustainability Commission.

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

	<u>This Meeting</u>	<u>Present to Date</u>	<u>FY 2021/2022 Excused Absences</u>	<u>FY 2021/2022 Unexcused Absences</u>
Roy Clark, Chair	X	59		
David Freedman	X	69		
Jennifer Futterman	E	46	2	1
Carl Baker	E	34	1	
Alex Ocañas	X	7	1	
Jake Torrens	X	7	1	
Don Barrett	X	6		
Randy Evans	E	5	1	

X = Present

E = Excused (notified Chair and Staff of absence)

L = Late

U = Unexcused (did not notify of absence)

REPORT OF POSTING OF AGENDA: The Agenda was available for public access at the City Hall exterior bulletin board (west side of the Council Chambers) by 5:30 PM Thursday, December 16, 2021 and posted on the City's website as required by established policies and procedures.

CITY STAFF PRESENT: Flinn Fagg, Director, Development Services; Tracy Sheldon, Program Coordinator, Office of Sustainability, and Francisco Jaime, Associate Civil Engineer, Engineering Services.

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

ACCEPTANCE OF THE AGENDA: Chair Clark asked if there were any objections to the agenda for the December 21, 2021 meeting. There were no objections, and the agenda was declared accepted.

GUESTS PRESENT: Clyde Prem with KOA, Jenny Yu with KOA, Leslie Scott with KOA, Nick Lowe with KOA, Mark Talkington with The Palm Springs Post, Grant Wilson, and Kim Floyd.

STAFF COMMENTS

- Associate Civil Engineer Francisco Jaime provided an update on the EV charging stations and added that the installation at the Museum Garage and City Hall have been pushed back approximately three (3) weeks due to delays with Southern California Edison.
- Program Coordinator Sheldon provided an update to the Airport Demonstration Garden that Marina Landscape began working on the irrigation and prepping the turf for removal the week of December 20, 2021. Additionally, Marina Landscape provided a construction schedule with a projected completion date of February 22, 2022 without any unforeseen construction delays.

PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

A. PRESENTATIONS

- The KOA team consisting of Clyde Prem, Jenny Yu, Leslie Scott and Nick Lowe provided a presentation on the Pedestrian Plan which was released on December 16, 2021. The project was financed through

Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) and has been in the works for the past 18 months and provides recommendations for pedestrian improvements in Palm Springs. The purpose of the plan is to create safer streets for pedestrian travel, develop new routes, improve public health and position the City of Palm Springs for future funding opportunities.

- The five highest ranked projects are:
 - Tahquitz Canyon Way (Museum Dr to Farrell Dr); leading pedestrian interval at crosswalks (LPI), protected left turns
 - Ramon Rd (Sunrise Way to Avenida Caballeros); LPI, protected left turns, mid-block crosswalks
 - Calle Encilia (Ramon Rd to Alejo Rd); lighting, sidewalk
 - Vista Chino (Indian Canyon Dr to Sunrise Way); LPI, protected left turns, sidewalks, traffic signal
 - Baristo Rd (Avenida Caballeros to Farrell Dr); sidewalk, crosswalks, LPI
- Director Fagg added that a request for corrections has been received from the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians which has been forwarded to KOA for updating. Director Fagg added that the corrections do not impact the data.
- The final report is available at <https://bit.ly/PSPedestrianPlanReport>.

B. MEETING MINUTES

- Chair Clark inquired if there were any objections to the meeting minutes for the Regular November 16, 2021 meeting. There were no objections, and the meeting minutes were accepted unanimously.

C. OLD BUSINESS

1. Food Ware Consultants – Program Coordinator Sheldon reported
 - Program Coordinator Sheldon provided an update on the work completed by Abbe & Associates and ReCreate thus far. Both consultants have been contacting businesses both remotely and in-person to provide technical assistance. Abbe & Associates held in-person meetings on December 13-14, 2021 and ReCreate held in-person meetings December 16, 20 and 21, 2021. The next round of in-person visits is scheduled for January 19-21, 2022.
 - The issue of lids and sleeves for hot beverages has been a concern for many of the business owners of coffee shops. The solution is to follow the State’s language with AB 1276 and allow lids and sleeves on hot beverages. AB 1276 goes into effect June 1, 2022 to define “Single-use foodware accessory” as:
 - Utensils, which is defined as forks, knives, spoons and sporks.
 - Chopsticks.
 - Condiment cups and packets.
 - Straws.
 - Stirrers. Splash sticks.
 - Cocktail sticks.
 - Program Coordinator Sheldon is creating “Point of Sale” signage to educate customers of the ordinance with “Please Take Only What You Need” and “Upon Request Only” and signage which bans the sale of food service ware items made in whole or in part from Polystyrene. All of the signage is being produced in English and Spanish and is posted on the City’s website at <https://www.palmspringsca.gov/services/sustainability-and-recycling/single-use-plastics>.
2. Night Sky Memo Update – Commissioner Ocañas reported
 - Commissioner Ocañas shared she has been researching other city policies from Pima County, AZ (which includes Tucson) and Malibu, CA as well as the International Dark-Sky Association. The intent is to update the landscape code and not update the outdoor lighting code. Commissioner Ocañas stated that Malibu hired a consultant to create their Dark Sky policy which the City of Palm Springs may consider.
 - The next steps will be for Chair Clark, Commissioner Ocañas and Program Coordinator Sheldon to meet and review the information from Pima County, AZ and Malibu, CA along with the information former Vice Chair McCann completed and provide an update to the Commission at the January 18, 2022 meeting.
 - Chair Clark asked for other Commissioners to volunteer to work with Commissioner Ocañas on Night

Sky's. Vice Chair Freedman stated he can review documentation after a draft is produced.

- Vice Chair Freedman cautioned to not interfere with the California Energy Code on outdoor lighting and to focus on landscape lighting only.

D. NEW BUSINESS

1. Residential Energy Rebate Program

- Chair Clark stated this item will be deferred until the January 18, 2022 Commission meeting to allow for Commissioners to review the draft to discuss in further detail in January.
- Vice Chair Freedman provided comments to the draft document after the agenda was posted. Chair Clark requested the comments be distributed to the Commission after the meeting.
- Vice Chair Freedman suggested Commissioner Barrett provide feedback on energy efficient upgrades for mobile homes.
- Chair Clark requested a meeting be held prior to the January 18, 2022 Commission meeting to consider additional context for the program. Program Coordinator Sheldon will schedule a meeting with Chair Clark, Vice Chair Freedman and Commissioner Barrett.

E. SUBCOMMITTEE AND COMMISSIONER REPORTS

1. Standing Subcommittee on Solar and Green Building – Vice Chair Freedman noted the following information to supplement his written report:

- Vice Chair Freedman shared an update that the Commercial Carbon Free Renewable Energy Ordinance is drafted. He is waiting to hear back from a consultant who stated the State's Reach Code Program may have some no-cost resources. If no additional resources are available, Vice Chair Freedman will work with staff to complete the draft.
- Vice Chair Freedman stated the Home Energy Efficiency Ordinance draft completed in regard to the technical review. He has had the Reach Code contacts review the draft ordinance confirming it is in line with State requirements.
- Vice Chair Freedman shared the Building Standards Commission approved the 2022 California Energy Code and goes into effect on January 1, 2023. As part of his role with CVAG, Vice Chair Freedman stated he will be developing training programs for the 2022 Energy Code.
- Vice Chair Freedman stated that the CPUC proposed net energy metering decision leaves Palm Springs with the highest solar requirements in the State. In the decision, Southern California Edison will be able to charge \$8.00 a kilowatt for solar systems.

2. Standing Subcommittee on Waste Reduction – Program Coordinator Sheldon reviewed the written report and added the following:

- Program Coordinator Sheldon added to the comprehensive report on mulch and compost analysis that 3,820 tons will need to be purchased from Coachella Valley Compost and received a quote of approximately \$84,000. The report states that a ½ inch application at city parks meets 99% of the required amount per SB 1383 requirements.
- Program Coordinator Sheldon stated the outreach and education planning for SB 1383 is in process. The most significant issue for outreach planning has been the inability to confirm the opening date of the Edom Hill facility for food waste as the infrastructure is not built out. A three prong outreach approach will target residents, commercial businesses, and tourists. Messaging will be delivered through social media, city website, PSTV, ONE-PS meetings, television, videos, Chamber of Commerce, Convention Center, billboard ads, Palm Springs Tourism.
- Program Coordinator Sheldon shared that new stickers have been placed on the Downtown recycling containers and an audit will be performed the last week of December to identify if the messaging is effective.
- Program Coordinator Sheldon stated the next Shredding and E-waste event will be held on Saturday, January 15, 2022 and that volunteers are needed.
- Program Coordinator Sheldon shared that the Office of Sustainability has been hosting a booth space at the Certified Farmers Market on the first Saturday of each month and that both current and former Commissioners have been volunteering.
- Commissioner Torrens inquired if residential food waste can be collected prior to July 1, 2022.
- Vice Chair Freedman inquired if residents could order a green cart now and if food waste can be placed in the green cart now.

- Program Coordinator Sheldon shared that commercial businesses have already been collecting food waste under AB 1826 and the commercial food waste does go down valley to Coachella Valley Compost.
 - Commissioner Torrens inquired if commercial businesses would accept food waste from residents.
 - Commissioner Torrens stated he would contact the Community Composters about managing food waste between January 1 – June 30, 2022.
3. Standing Subcommittee on World Environment Day – Commissioner Futterman
 - Commissioner Futterman will have a budget request prepared for World Environment Day 2022 at the January 18, 2022 meeting.
 4. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Walkability & Pedestrian Planning – Chair Clark reported
 - Chair Clark stated the Ad Hoc Subcommittee will be dissolved due to delivery of final Pedestrian Plan.
 5. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Night Sky
 - No additional report.
 6. Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Strategic Planning and General Plan Update – Chair Clark reported
 - Chair Clark stated the updated draft version of the Sustainability Strategic Plan was included in the agenda packet which is an outcome of the Special meeting held on October 5, 2021. Chair Clark stated work will resume on working on the document so it will be ready for integration with General Plan.
 - Chair Clark stated the subcommittee will meet again within the next month or two to make progress on the document before June 30, 2022.
 - Director Fagg stated there is support for integrating Sustainability into the General Plan and suggest the subcommittee continue discussions with David Newell.
 7. Bicycle Routes and Cycling – Commissioner Torrens reported
 - Commissioner Torrens stated the bike survey has not been distributed. Program Coordinator Sheldon shared the draft survey is lengthy and the subcommittee was asked to consolidate the survey. Commissioner Ocañas volunteered to review and edit the survey as surveying is a feature of her profession. Program Coordinator Sheldon will forward the draft survey to Commissioner Ocañas after the meeting.
 - Commissioner Barrett stated concerns with the location of lights for cyclists at intersections and the need to relocate for improved functionality.
 - Commissioner Torrens stated the improvements for pedestrian mobility should also include cyclist improvements.
 8. Water Conservation – Vice Chair Freedman reported
 - Vice Chair Freedman stated the DWA Board met on December 21, 2021 and he provided an update on the airport demonstration garden.
 - DWA reports that water use is down 18.65% in November 2021 compared to data from November 2013.
 - Vice Chair Freedman stated we are still in a drought and need to assist DWA with their outreach and DWA's rebate programs.
 - Vice Chair Freedman shared DWA will resume disconnection for non-payment accounts beginning January 1, 2022.
 - Vice Chair Freedman stated another funding opportunity for DWA may be available under the Governors Emergency Drought Declaration which could provide approximately \$200,000 in disadvantaged community grant programs which should be available within the next month or two.
 9. Wellness – Commissioner Baker
 - Chair Clark provided an update in Commissioner Baker's absence. The most recent ordinance draft provides that 10% of rooms to be made available as smoking rooms as opposed to the current State law which requires hotels to provide 20% of their rooms to be available to smoking guests. Additionally, it needs to be confirmed with the City Attorney that already permitted smoking lounges would not have to comply with the ordinance.
 - Program Coordinator Sheldon shared an update from Director Virata. The Human Rights Commission (HRC) reviewed the most recent version on December 20, 2021. The HRC does have a concern that lower income families may be disproportionality if more of them live in multi-family dwellings.
 10. Desert Community Energy, Community Advisory Committee – Vice Chair Freedman reported

- Vice Chair Freedman stated that Commissioner Barrett will be the new representative on the DCE Community Advisory Committee.
- Vice Chair Freedman will now be the DCE Program Manager in his new role at CVAG.
- Vice Chair Freedman shared DCE's outreach plan for the OhmConnect thermostat incentive program. Additionally, the City has been posting the incentive program on City social media channels.
- Vice Chair Freedman shared that DCE is reporting that rate charges for carbon free product will remain unchanged and that SCE rates will increase.
- Commissioner Barrett stated the OhmConnect smart thermostat cannot be utilized by mobile home park residents since they are on master meters.

F. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND UPCOMING AGENDA

- Vice Chair Freedman requested more guidance on social media rules as it applies to Commissions and requested Guidance on Electronic Records and Public Integrity Ordinance be provided by the City Clerk's Office. Chair Clark stated the City Clerk's office has been scheduled to present at the January 18, 2022 Sustainability Commission meeting as they were unavailable for the December meeting.
- Chair Clark shared that staff applied to Measure J for San Rafael and Sunrise as a turf conversion project.
- Chair Clark shared the annual ONE-PS picnic will be held on March 19, 2022. The Office of Sustainability will host a booth to provide education and outreach on SB 1383. The reusable food ware ordinance will be in effect and we will need to make sure food vendors are educated to not use Polystyrene products. Commissioner Barrett stated the picnic date may change due to the recent increase in Covid.
- Director Fagg shared the Development Service Department is moving to an online submittal system for all permits and entitlement applications beginning January 1, 2022. This will drastically reduce paper usage as electronic storage of all documents. Paper agendas are still being used by other Commissions and requested the Sustainability Commission to encourage them to move to electronic agendas and materials.

G. ADJOURNMENT - The meeting of the Sustainability Commission adjourned at **7:04** p.m. They adjourned to the Regular Meeting of the Sustainability Commission to be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, January 18, 2022, location to be determined. There is a possibility that the next meeting will be via telecommunication also. The Sustainability Commission's regular meeting schedule is at 5:30 p.m. the third Tuesday each month except August unless otherwise noted or amended.

Respectfully Submitted,

Tracy Sheldon, Program Coordinator, Office of Sustainability